

CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE RFP EVALUATION COMMITTEE TABULATION

RFP# 575-11928

TITLE: Group DHMO and DPPO Dental Plan Benefits

DATE: 4/11/2017

| | Rater #1 - Matthew Cobb | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|----------------|-------------------------|----------|----------------|------------------|---------|----------------|--------------------|---------|----------------|---------------------|---------|----------------|-------------------------|
| | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | Size, | accessi | bility, | | e level | - | The level of | | | | | | |
| | adequacy and | | | benefits for the | | | benefits for the | | | | | | |
| | q | uality o | of | DHMO plan; the | | | indemnity DPPO | | | | | | |
| | networks in | | | satisf | action | level | plan; the | | | | | | |
| | Broward, Dade, | | | of | existi | ng | satisfaction level | | | Total premium | | | |
| | P.Beach and | | | empl | oyer cl | ients, | of existing | | | cost including rate | | | |
| | Monr | oe Cou | ınties | mei | mbers | and | employer clients, | | | guarantees and | | | |
| | with minimal | | | netwo | rk pro | viders; | members and | | | renewal caps | | | |
| | displacement of | | | the ability to | | | network | | | | | | |
| | existing network | | | provide the | | | providers; the | | | | | | |
| | providers; national | | | requested | | | ability to provide | | | | | | |
| | DHMO and DPPO | | | | rience | | the requested | | | | | | |
| PROPOSING FIRM | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Total Points Awarded |
| Aetna | 0.3 | 2 | 0.60 | 0.2 | 2 | 0.40 | 0.2 | 2 | 0.40 | | 2 | 0.60 | 2.00 |
| Cigna | 0.3 | 1 | 0.30 | 0.2 | 1 | 0.20 | 0.2 | 1 | 0.20 | 0.3 | 1 | 0.30 | 1.00 |

| | Size, | accessi | bility, | The level of The level of | | | | | | | | | | | |
|----------------|--|----------|----------------|---------------------------|----------|----------------|--|------------------|----------------|---------------|---------|----------------|-------------------------|--|--|
| | ade | quacy | and | bene | efits fo | r the | bene | benefits for the | | | 1 | | | | |
| | q | uality o | of | DHM | 10 plar | indemnity DPPO | | | | | | | | | |
| | ne | tworks | in | satisf | faction | level | plan; the satisfaction level | | | | | | | | |
| | Brov | vard, D | ade, | of | fexisti | ng | | | | Tota | | | | | |
| | P.Beach and Monroe Counties with minimal displacement of existing network providers; national | | | empl | oyer cl | ients, | of existing employer clients, members and network | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | mei | mbers | and | | | | cost ir | | | | | |
| | | | | netwo | rk pro | viders; | | | | guar ren | | | | | |
| | | | | the | ability | /to | | | | Ten | | | | | |
| | | | | provide the | | | providers; the | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | re | queste | ed | ability to provide the requested | | | | | | | | |
| | DHMO and DPPO | | expe | erience | and | | | | | | | | | | |
| | network for | | | utili | zation | data | experience and | | | | | | | | |
| PROPOSING FIRM | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Total Points Awarded | | |
| Aetna | 0.3 | 2 | 0.60 | _ | 2 | 0.40 | 0.2 | 2 | | 0.3 | 2 | 0.60 | | | |
| Cigna | 0.3 | 1 | 0.30 | 0.2 | 1 | 0.20 | 0.2 | 1 | 0.20 | 0.3 | 1 | 0.30 | 1.00 | | |

| | | | | Rater #3 - Steve Simac The level of The leve | | | | | | | | | | | |
|----------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------|----------------|--|--|----------------|-------------------------------------|-------------------|---------------------|---------------|----------------|----------------|----------------------|-------------------------------|---------------|
| | Size, accessibility, adequacy and | | • • • | | e Ievel efits fo | - | The level of benefits for the | | | | | | | | |
| | quality of networks in | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | DHMO plan; the indemnity DPPO satisfaction level plan; the | | | | | | | | | | |
| | Broward, Dade, P.Beach and | | | existi | | | faction | | Tota | l prem | ium | | | | |
| | | | | oyer clients, | | of existing | | | cost including rate | | | | | | |
| | Mon | oe Cou | ınties | mei | mbers | bers and | | employer clients, | | | guarantees and | | | | |
| | wit | h minii | mal | netwo | rk pro | viders; | members and network | | | renewal caps | | | | | |
| | | aceme | | | ability | | | | | | | | | | |
| | existing network | | | | ovide t | | providers; the | | | | | | | | |
| | | lers; na O and | | requested experience and | | | ability to provide the requested | | | | | | | | |
| | DHIV | O ano | JPPO | expe | nence | ano | me | reques | iea | | | | | - | T |
| PROPOSING FIRM | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Weight Factor | Ranking | Point Subtotal | Total Points Awarded | Total Combined Points Awarded | Final Ranking |
| Aetna | 0.3 | 2 | 0.60 | 0.2 | 2 | | 0.2 | 2 | 0.40 | | 2 | 0.60 | _ | | |
| Cigna | 0.3 | 1 | 0.30 | 0.2 | 1 | 0.20 | 0.2 | 1 | 0.20 | 0.3 | 1 | 0.30 | 1.00 | 3.00 | 1 |