



CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE

HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD
 CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE
 WEDNESDAY, DECEMBER 3, 2018 - 5:00 P.M.
 CITY HALL 9th FLOOR CONFERENCE ROOM
 100 NORTH ANDREWS AVENUE
 FORT LAUDERDALE, FLORIDA

<u>Board Members</u>	<u>Attendance</u>	<u>Cumulative Attendance</u> <u>6/2018 through 5/2019</u>	
		<u>Present</u>	<u>Absent</u>
David Kyner, Chair	P	6	0
George Figler, Vice Chair	P	6	0
Jason Blank	P	4	2
Brenda Flowers	P	5	1
Marilyn Mammano	P	6	0
Donna Mergenhagen	P	5	1
Arthur Marcus	P	6	0
David Parker	P	6	0
Richard Rosa	A	5	1
Jason Wetherington	A	3	2

City Staff

Shari Wallen, Assistant City Attorney
 Trisha Logan, Planner III
 Suellen Robertson, Administrative Assistant
 Ella Parker, Urban Design and Planning Manager
 Lorraine Tappen, Principal Planner
 Commissioner Steve Glassman
 Jamie Opperee, Fabricio Ramos, Recording Secretaries, Prototype Inc.

Communication to the City Commission

None

<u>Index</u>	<u>Applicant/Owner</u>	<u>Page</u>
1. H-18-026	Stranahan House, Inc./April Kirk	<u>2</u>
2. H-18-027	BRE Silver MF Exchange FL LLC/ Derek Vander Ploeg	<u>5</u>
3. H-18-028	School Board of Broward County/ Acai Associates, Inc.	<u>6</u>
4. H-18-029	Thomas and Holly Forney	<u>7</u>
	Good of the City	<u>9</u>
	Communication to the City Commission	<u>11</u>

1. Call to Order/Pledge of Allegiance

Chair Kyner called the meeting of the Historic Preservation Board to order at 5:00 p.m.

II. Determination of Quorum/Approval of Minutes

Roll was called and it was determined a quorum was present.

Motion made by Mr. Parker, seconded by Mr. Marcus, to approve the minutes of the Board's October 2018 meeting. In a voice vote, motion passed unanimously.

III. Public Sign-in/Swearing-In

All members of the public wishing to address the Board on any item were sworn in.

Board members disclosed communications and site visits they had regarding each case.

IV. Agenda Items:

1.

[Index](#)

Case	H18026
Owner	Stranahan House, Inc.
Applicant	April Kirk, Director
Address	335 SE 6 th Avenue
General Location	Approximately 150'-0" south of the intersection of East Las Olas Boulevard and South Federal Highway/SE 6 th Avenue
Legal Description	BURNHAMS SUB 15-29 B TR 1 LESS N 47.5 & LESS RD R/W
Zoning	H-1
Existing Use	House Museum
Proposed Use	House Museum
Applicable ULDR Sections	ULDR Section 47-24.11.C.3.c.i ; Section 47-24.11.C.3.c.ii
Request	<p>Certificate of Appropriateness for minor alteration.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Construction of a new deck over the existing waterfront patio.

[See staff report attached hereto]

Ms. Logan reviewed the staff report and concluded with:

In accordance with Sections 47-24.11.C.3.c.i and 47-24.11.C.3.c.i of the ULDR, staff recommends that the application for a COA for the construction of a new deck over the

existing waterfront patio under case number H18026 located at 335 SE 6th Street be **Approved with the following Conditions:**

1. This application is subject to the approval by Building, Zoning, and all ULDR requirements.
2. A professional archaeologist, who meets the Secretary of the Interior's Professional Standards for such work as set forth in 36 CFR part 61 as *amended*, should monitor any *new* ground-disturbance activity associated with the proposed development. A letter of agreement for monitoring shall be submitted at the time of the submittal of a building permit application. A monitoring report from the archaeologist shall be submitted to the Historic Preservation Board Liaison within (45) days following the completion of work. If the professional archaeologist deems the subject property does not require monitoring, a letter from the archaeologist stating that monitoring is not necessary shall be submitted to the Historic Preservation Board Liaison. It is recommended that monitoring shall include, but not be limited to the following:
 - a. Removal of existing concrete (such as indicated on Sheet L-0.1 and Sheet L-0.2)
 - b. Excavation of bench footings (such as indicated in Detail 8 of Sheet S-1.2)

April Kirk, Director of Stranahan House, introduced Douglas Smith, President of EDSA. He gave a Power Point presentation, a copy of which is attached to these minutes for the public record.

The Board and Mr. Smith discussed differentiating the new deck from the existing wood.

Chair Kyner remarked that they needed to be thinking about how to raise Stranahan House in the future to protect it from sea level rise. Mr. Smith said they hoped to have enough money in the future for this.

Ms. Mergenhagen remarked on how central the porch was to Stranahan House's history.

Chair Kyner opened the public input portion of the meeting. There being no one present wishing to address the Board on this matter, Chair Kyner closed the public hearing and brought the discussion back to the Board.

Mr. Figler was concerned about the colors being used on the new deck making it difficult to differentiate the one step, creating a safety issue. The similar color also made it difficult to distinguish the old from the new. Mr. Blank noted that the new boards would be laid in a different orientation. Mr. Smith stated they were open to considering a color change.

The Board and Mr. Smith continued to discuss the color options for the new deck.

Ms. Wallen reminded the Board to refer to the criteria, and pointed out that if there was a historic basis for changing the color, they could consider it. Ms. Mammano believed that ensuring there was a visible distinction between the ground and the porch was within the Board's purview. Ms. Kirk stated they needed to review a color change with their team and requested approval with the agreement that they would be changing the color. Ms. Wallen stated the change would need to come back to the Board for approval; it could not be done administratively.

Ms. Logan remarked that the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines stated there should be a differentiation between the historic and new materials.

Motion made by Mr. Blank, seconded by Ms. Mergenhagen to approve with the following condition the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness under case number H18026 located at 335 SE 6th Avenue for the construction of a new deck over the existing waterfront patio based on a finding this request is consistent with the purpose and intent of the Secretary of the Interior Standards for Historic Preservation and complies with the Historic Design Guidelines, as outlined in the above staff memorandum.

1. This application is subject to the approval by Building, Zoning, and all ULDR requirements.
2. A professional archaeologist, who meets the Secretary of the Interior's Professional Standards for such work as set forth in 36 CFR part 61 as *amended*, should monitor any *new* ground-disturbance activity associated with the proposed development. A letter of agreement for monitoring shall be submitted at the time of the submittal of a building permit application. A monitoring report from the archaeologist shall be submitted to the Historic Preservation Board Liaison within (45) days following the completion of work. If the professional archaeologist deems the subject property does not require monitoring, a letter from the archaeologist stating that monitoring is not necessary shall be submitted to the Historic Preservation Board Liaison. It is recommended that monitoring shall include, but not be limited to the following:
 - a. Removal of existing concrete (such as indicated on Sheet L-0.1 and Sheet L-0.2)
 - b. Excavation of bench footings (such as indicated in Detail 8 of Sheet S-1.2)

Ms. Mammano objected to not including a requirement regarding the color of the decking and the Board further discussed whether a color change should be required on the new deck.

Ms. Kirk requested a deferral to the Board's next meeting.

Mr. Blank withdrew his motion and Ms. Mergenhagen agreed.

Ms. Kirk agreed to return at the Board's next meeting with a new color option.

Motion made by Mr. Figler, seconded by Ms. Flowers, to grant a deferral to the Board's next meeting. In a voice vote, motion passed unanimously.

2.

[Index](#)

Case	H18027
Owner	BRE Silver MF Exchange FL LLC c/o LIVCOR
Applicant	Derek Vander Ploeg, VPA Architects
Address	115 NE 3 rd Ave
General Location	Southwest corner of the intersection at NE 2 nd Street and NE 3 rd Avenue
Legal Description	GEO M PHIPPENS SUB LOTS 3-6 BLK 1,3-10 BLK 14 FT LAUD B-146 D LOT 2 LESS ST R/W,4,6,8,10 BLK E LESS N 5 THEREOF
Zoning	RAC-CC
Existing Use	Multi-Family Residential
Proposed Use	Multi-Family Residential
Applicable ULDR Sections	ULDR Section 47-24.11.C.3.c.i; Section 47-24.11.C.3.c.ii
Request	Certificate of Appropriateness for Minor Alteration <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Construction of an ADA accessible ramp, relocation of stairs, and replacement of entry door.

[See staff report attached hereto]

Ms. Logan reviewed the staff report and concluded with:

In accordance with Sections 47-24.11.C.3.c.i and 47-24.11.C.3.c.ii of the ULDR, staff recommends that the application for a COA for construction of an ADA accessible ramp, relocation of stairs, and replacement of entry door under case number H18027 located at 115 NE 3rd Avenue be **Approved with the following Condition:**

1. This application is subject to the approval by Building, Zoning, and all ULDR requirements.

Derek Vander Ploeg, architect, described the proposed location for the ADA accessible ramp and how the planter would be reconfigured to accommodate it.

Chair Kyner opened the public input portion of the meeting. There being no one present wishing to address the Board on this matter, Chair Kyner closed the public hearing and brought the discussion back to the Board.

Motion made by Ms. Mammano, seconded by Mr. Figler to approve with the following condition the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness under case number H18027 located at 115 NE 3rd Avenue for the construction of an ADA accessible ramp, relocation of stairs, and replacement of entry door based on a finding this request is consistent with the purpose and intent of the Secretary of the Interior Standards for Historic Preservation and complies with the Historic Design Guidelines, as outlined in the above staff memorandum.

1. This application is subject to the approval by Building, Zoning, and all ULDR requirements.

In a roll voice vote, motion passed unanimously.

3.

[Index](#)

Case	H18028
Owner	School Board of Broward County
Applicant	Acai Associates, Inc.
Address	120 NE 11 th Street North Side Elementary School
General Location	Southwest corner of NE 11 th Street and NE 2 nd Avenue
Legal Description	PROGRESSO-REPLAT OF A POR OF BLK 185 41-25 B PARCEL B
Zoning	CF
Existing Use	School
Proposed Use	School
Applicable ULDR Sections	ULDR Section 47-24.11.C.3.c.i ; Section 47-24.11.C.3.c.ii
Request(s)	Certificate of Appropriateness for minor alteration. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Relocation of entry gate on north elevation.

[See staff report attached hereto]

Ms. Logan reviewed the staff report and concluded with:

In accordance with Sections 47-24.11.C.3.c.i and 47-24.11.C.3.c.ii of the ULDR, staff recommends that the application for a COA for relocation of entry gate on north elevation under case number H18028 located at 120 NE 11th Street be **Approved with the following Condition:**

1. This application is subject to the approval by Building, Zoning, and all ULDR requirements.

W. Randy Scott, project manager for ACAI Associates, explained that they wished to relocate the entrance to control access into the school, improving security. The gate needed to be moved forward to allow them to control access to the interior stairs and

therefore the rest of the building. The additional space would allow them to install a secondary gate to block the stairs.

Ms. Logan said she had been working with Mr. Scott for a year on this project and this was the option with the least impact to meet security requirements which would not affect the overall appearance of the structure.

Chair Kyner opened the public input portion of the meeting. There being no one present wishing to address the Board on this matter, Chair Kyner closed the public hearing and brought the discussion back to the Board.

Motion made by Mr. Figler, seconded by Ms. Mammano to approve with the following condition the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness under case number H18028 located at 120 NE 11th Street for the relocation of entry gate on north elevation based on a finding this request is consistent with the purpose and intent of the Secretary of the Interior Standards for Historic Preservation and complies with the Historic Design Guidelines, as outlined in the above staff memorandum.

1. This application is subject to the approval by Building, Zoning, and all ULDR requirements.

In a voice vote, motion passed unanimously.

4.

[Index](#)

Case	H18029	FMSF#	BD02877
Owner	Thunderbird LP, Tom and Holly Forney		
Applicant	Tom Forney		
Address	1100 SW 6 th Street		
General Location	At the southwest corner of SW 6 th Street and SW 11 th Avenue		
Legal Description	A PORTION OF LOTS 2 AND 3, BLOCK 21, AMENDED PLAT OF RIVERSIDE ADDITION TO FORT LAUDERDALE, ACCORDING THE PLAT THEREOF, AS RECORDED IN PLAT BOOK 1, PAGE 13, OF THE PUBLIC RECORDS OF BROWARD COUNTY, FLORIDA.		
Existing Use	Single-Family Residential		
Proposed Use	Single-Family Residential		
Zoning	RS-8		
Applicable ULDR Sections	ULDR Section 47-24.11.C.3.c.i ; Section 47-24.11.C.3.c.ii		
Request	Certificate of Appropriateness for Minor Alteration		

- | | |
|--|---|
| | <ul style="list-style-type: none">● Exterior alterations; replacement of windows and doors throughout; and replacement of existing roofing with new asphalt shingle roof. |
|--|---|

[See staff report attached hereto]

Ms. Logan reviewed the staff report and concluded with the following:

In accordance with Sections 47-24.11.C.3.c.i and 47-24.11.C.3.c.ii of the ULDR, staff recommends that the application for a COA for exterior alterations; replacement of windows and doors throughout; and existing roofing with new asphalt shingle roof under case number H18029 located at 1100 SW 6th Street be **Approved with the following**

Conditions:

1. All windows and doors shall have clear glass with the option of low-e.
2. Replacement windows on the second and first floor of the east and west elevations shall be 1-over-1 single-hung windows.
3. New doors on east and west elevations shall not have muntins.
4. The location of the header of openings on the first floor of the rear porch shall not be lowered and windows shall be either clear glass casements or fixed windows to emulate an open or screened in porch.
5. This application is subject to the approval by Building, Zoning, and all ULDR requirements.

Ms. Logan reviewed renderings of the proposed windows and doors and Mr. Marcus wondered if all of these changes would allow the property to maintain its designation. Ms. Logan explained that the main significance of this building related to the cultural and historic aspects rather than the architectural aspects. The owner was trying to make the façades consistent. Flavio Coronel, architect, confirmed for Chair Kyner that they would not change the roof.

Chair Kyner opened the public input portion of the meeting. There being no one present wishing to address the Board on this matter, Chair Kyner closed the public hearing and brought the discussion back to the Board.

Commissioner Glassman stepped in at 6:47 p.m. to thank the Board for their efforts.

Ms. Logan read an email from the owner indicating he agreed to all of the staff conditions.

Motion made by Ms. Mergenhagen, seconded by Ms. Mammano, to approve with the following conditions the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness under case number H18029 located at 1100 SW 6th Street for the exterior alterations; replacement of windows and doors throughout; and existing roofing with new asphalt shingle roof based on a finding these requests are consistent with the purpose and intent of the Secretary

of the Interior Standards for Historic Preservation and comply with the Historic Design Guidelines, as outlined in the above staff memorandum.

1. All windows and doors shall have clear glass with the option of low-e.
2. Replacement windows on the second and first floor of the east and west elevations shall be 1-over-1 single-hung windows.
3. New doors on east and west elevations shall not have muntins.
4. The location of the header of openings on the first floor of the rear porch shall not be lowered and windows shall be either clear glass casements or fixed windows to emulate an open or screened in porch.
5. This application is subject to the approval by Building, Zoning, and all ULDR requirements.

Chair Kyner asked if the rear façade was considered a view shed from the river side of the property. Ms. Logan explained that they did take into account the visibility from the river and the street. The Secretary of the Interior's standards related to maintaining the overall integrity of the building and retaining the architecturally significant features of the building.

In a roll call vote, motion passed 7-1 with Mr. Marcus opposed.

VI. Good of the City

[Index](#)

5. COMPREHENSIVE PLAN – HISTORIC PRESERVATION

ELEMENT: Presentation by Eddie Ng of the Corradino Group on the Update to the City of Fort Lauderdale's Comprehensive Plan – Historic Preservation Element.

Lorraine Tappen, Principal Planner, and Edward Ng, the Corradino Group, provided a Power Point Presentation, a copy of which is attached to these minutes for the public record.

Mr. Marcus asked how the City would address saving buildings from demolition so they could be preserved. Ms. Tappen said letting property owners know their options was important. Mr. Marcus thought a government policy was needed.

Mammano referred to page three of the Neighborhood Enhancement Historic Preservation Element document, which contained objectives, unlike the Advance Fort Lauderdale Comprehensive Plan document Ms. Tappen was explaining. Ms. Mammano wanted to include measures of success under objectives and policies so they could determine if they were achieving their goals. Ms. Tappen stated there were evaluation measures in HP 2.1 but they could add more.

Ms. Mammano asked what other surveys needed to be done and Ms. Logan described surveys that had already been done in the City and said the Certified Local Government should continually evaluate properties in the City.

Mr. Ng explained that the Strategic Plan is the implementation of the Comprehensive Plan. Ms. Tappen said in general, any of the steps in the Neighborhood Enhancement Historic Preservation Element could be implemented at any time without waiting for the Comprehensive Plan to be adopted. Ms. Mergenhagen suggested identifying and fast tracking objectives that were close to being done and were applicable. She asked if the Archeological Resource Protection objective was close to being defined and Ms. Logan stated they had a part-time archeological consultant available to evaluate sites and make comments.

Ms. Mammano wanted to find a way to make the objectives more than aspirational, using evaluations or timelines. Mr. Ng agreed, and said their Parks and Recreation element did have timelines.

Ms. Mammano pointed out that objective HP 2.1.4, regarding a transfer of development rights program, should be made policy because they knew it would be beneficial to the preservation of historic resources.

Ms. Tappen and Mr. Ng invited email comments from Board members.

Mr. Blank felt they should first record the City's historic resources and then determine the best plan possible. Mr. Parker stated once they knew what they had, they could discuss protecting it before it was gone.

Abby Laughlin, resident, said the problem was that this was an unfunded mandate that shifted the cost burden to the property owner without his/her consent. This was why people demolished properties they feared would be designated. She said a lot more could be done to involve property owners in the process.

Ella Parker, Urban Design and Planning Manager, referred to the timeline and said they were first talking to advisory boards and then would conduct community outreach. Public workshops were planned in March and April 2019 and they had created a very interactive website.

Mr. Parker was concerned that the timeframe was too ambitious. He pointed out that some HOAs met only yearly. Ms. Parker stated they would be encouraging input through February 2020.

6. Historic Preservation Board 2019 Calendar

Motion made by Mr. Blank, seconded by Ms. Mammano to approve the Board's 2019 calendar. In a voice vote, motion passed unanimously.

V. Communication to the City Commission [Index](#)
None

Adjournment

There being no further business to come before the Board, the meeting was adjourned at 7:47 p.m.

Attest:

Chairman:



ProtoType Inc. Recording Secretary



David Kyner, Chair

The City of Fort Lauderdale maintains a [Website](#) for the Historic Preservation Board Meeting Agendas and Results:

<http://www.fortlauderdale.gov/departments/city-clerk-s-office/board-and-committee-agendas-and-minutes/historic-preservation-board>

Any written public comments made 48 hours prior to the meeting regarding items discussed during the proceedings have been attached hereto.