

## HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE MONDAY, AUGUST 5, 2019 - 5:00 P.M. CITY HALL COMMISSION CHAMBERS 100 NORTH ANDREWS AVENUE FORT LAUDERDALE, FLORIDA

6/2019 through 5/2020			
Present	Absent		
2	0		
1	1		
2	0		
1	1		

2

2

1

2

1

Cumulative Attendance

0

0

1

0

1

# **City Staff**

Jason Wetherington

**Board Members** 

George Figler, Chair

Marilyn Mammano Donna Mergenhagen

Arthur Marcus

David Parker

Richard Rosa Tim Schiavone

Jason Blank, Vice Chair

Shari Wallen, Assistant City Attorney
Trisha Logan, Urban Planner III
Yvonne Redding, Urban Planner III
Brigette Chiappetta, Recording Secretary, Prototype Inc.

## **Communication to the City Commission**

Ms. Mammano made a motion, seconded by Mr. Marcus, to send the following communication to the City Commission:

**Attendance** 

P

A P

A

P

P P

P

A

The Board recommends staff consider making a change to the ordinance to permit vinyl windows that meet hurricane qualifications in accordance with the Miami-Dade requirements to make these permissible in the Sailboat Bend Historic District for replacement and new construction.

In a voice vote, motion passed 6-0.

Index	Owner/Applicant	Page
1. H19020	Urban North, LLC/Jay Adams	2
2. H19022	Sergey and Tatiana Golikov	4
3. H19023	Dawn M. McCann	6
	Communication to the City Commission	7
	Good of the City	<u>7</u>

## I. Call to Order/Pledge of Allegiance

The meeting of the Historic Preservation Board was called to order at 5:00 p.m.

## II. Determination of Quorum/Approval of Minutes

Roll was called and it was determined a quorum was present.

**Motion** made by Ms. Mammano, seconded by Mr. Marcus to approve the minutes of the Board's June 2019 meeting. In a voice vote, motion passed unanimously.

Ms. Wallen advised that the Florida legislature had passed a new statute in July requiring a board, when approving, approving with condition(s) or denying an application for a development order or permit, to issue written findings. Additionally, boards must rule on applications within 180 days from the date staff determined the application was complete. Administrative approvals had 120 days from the date staff determined the application was complete. Ms. Wallen added that the Board's decisions should be based on fact, and they could adopt the staff report as part of their motions to declare this was the factual basis for their decision.

#### III. Public Sign-in/Swearing-In

All members of the public wishing to address the Board on any item were sworn in.

## IV. Agenda Items:

1. <u>Index</u>

			IIIdox
Case Number	H19020	FMSF#	BD01976
Owner	Urban North, LLC		
Applicant	Jay Adams		
Address	901 Progresso Drive		
General Location	Northeast corner of NE 3rd Avenue and Progresso Drive		
Logal Description	PROGRESSO 2-18 D TRIANGULAR TR LYING S OF BLK		
Legal Description	214 & E OF BLK 256		
Existing Use	Commercial: Mixed-use		
Proposed Use	Commercial: Mixed-use		
Zoning	NWRAC-MUne		
Applicable ULDR	47-24.11.C.3.c.i; 47-24.11.C.3.c.ii		
Sections			
Authored By	Trisha Logan, Urban Planner III		

# **REQUEST:** Certificate of Appropriateness for Minor Alteration

 Alteration to select existing windows and doors in three bays on the south elevation to accommodate new bi-fold windows and folding doors; enclosure of one door opening on the north elevation to accommodate placement of a new gas meter.

[See staff report attached hereto]

Ms. Logan reviewed the staff report and concluded with:

In accordance with Sections 47-24.11.C.3.c.i and 47-24.11.C.3.c.ii of the ULDR, the application for a COA for alteration to select windows and doors under case number H19020 located at 901 Progresso Plaza <u>partially meets the criteria</u> outlined above.

Additionally, the applicant should clarify as to whether the existing wood molding for each opening will remain as existing or if it is to be removed as part of the alterations.

The following conditions are provided for consideration by the HPB if the application is to be approved:

- 1. All glass shall be clear and all muntins will have a raised profile.
- 2. The bottom rail of each French door or proposed folding door will maintain the same bottom rail height as the other doors throughout the structure.
- 3. Existing wood molding around each opening will remain as existing
- 4. This application is subject to the approval of Building, Zoning, and all ULDR requirements.

Mr. Marcus requested clarification regarding the door replacement locations and Steve Tilbrook, the applicant's attorney, and Robert Allica, architect, explained.

Mr. Tilbrook reported Jay Adams, owner and developer, had restored the building. Mr. Tilbrook said the application was to replace three sets of doors and windows on the ground floor facing a somewhat concealed courtyard and to remove one door in the rear of the building.

Mr. Adams explained that the gas company required the new meter to be located in the indicated space in the rear of the building where the door was to be removed.

Chair Figler opened the public input portion of the meeting. There being no one present wishing to address the Board on this matter, Chair Figler closed the public hearing and brought the discussion back to the Board.

Motion made by Ms. Mammano, seconded by Mr. Parker to recommend:

**Approval** of the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness under case number H19020 located at 901 Progresso Drive for alteration to select existing windows and doors in three bays on the south elevation to accommodate new bi-fold windows and folding doors; and enclosure of one door opening of the north elevation to accommodate placement of a new gas meter, based on a finding these requests are consistent with the Criteria for Certificates of Appropriateness, in Sections 47-24.11.C.3.c.i and 47-24.11.C.3.c.ii of the

ULDR, the purpose and intent of the Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation, and adoption of the findings of fact on pages 1, 2 and 3 of the Staff Report. Conditions:

- 1. All glass shall be clear and all muntins will have a raised profile.
- 2. The bottom rail of each French door or proposed folding door will maintain the same bottom rail height as the other doors throughout the structure.
- 3. Existing wood molding around each opening will remain as existing.
- 4. This application is subject to the approval of Building, Zoning, and all ULDR requirements.

In a voice vote, motion to approve with conditions passed 6-0.

2.			<u>Index</u>
Case Number	H19022	FMSF#	
Owner	Sergey and Tatiana Golikov		
Applicant	Sergey and Tatiana Golikov		
Address	821 SW 4 <sup>th</sup> Court		
General Location	North side of Southwest 4 <sup>th</sup> Court at the intersection of Southwest 4 <sup>th</sup> Court and Southwest 8 <sup>th</sup> Terrace		
Legal Description	BRYAN SUB BLK 64 FT LAUDERDALE 1-29 D LOT 30		
Existing Use	Single-Family Residential		
Proposed Use	Single-Family Residential		
Zoning	RML-25		
Applicable ULDR Sections	47-24.11.C.3.c.i, 47-17.7.B		

# **REQUEST:** Certificate of Appropriateness for Minor Alteration

Authored By Trisha Logan, Urban Planner III

• Installation of new and after-the-fact replacement windows throughout.

[See staff report attached hereto]

Ms. Logan reviewed the staff report and concluded with:

In accordance with Sections 47-17.7.B and 47-24.11.C.3.c.iii of the ULDR, staff finds that the application for a COA for installation of new and after-the-fact replacement windows throughout under case number H19013 located at 821 SW 4<sup>th</sup> Court partially meets the criteria outlined above.

Window replacements proposed for the front façade and portions of the side elevation that are visible from the right-of-way meet the criteria. However, windows that are not visible from the right-of-way do not meet the criteria.

The following conditions are provided for consideration by the HPB if the application is to be approved:

- 1. All glass shall be clear and all muntins shall have a raised profile.
- 2. This application is subject to the approval of Building, Zoning, and all ULDR requirements.

Sergey Golikov, owner, said he had changed the types of windows visible from the street to be installed.

Mr. Marcus and Chair Figler were concerned that the building's character was being compromised by installing a split widow on the south elevation. Mr. Golikov said this was changed by a previous owner.

Ms. Mammano felt staff and the owner had come to a reasonable compromise and this was a big improvement over the owner's previous application.

Chair Figler opened the public input portion of the meeting. There being no one present wishing to address the Board on this matter, Chair Figler closed the public hearing and brought the discussion back to the Board.

Motion made by Mr. Marcus, seconded by Mr. Rosa to recommend:

**Approval** of the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness under case number H19022 located at 821 SW 4th Court for installation of new and after-the-fact replacement windows throughout, based on a finding these requests are consistent with the Criteria for Certificates of Appropriateness, in Section 47-24.11.C.3.c.i of the ULDR, and are consistent the purpose and intent of the Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation, are consistent with the Sailboat Bend material and design guidelines in Section 47-17.7.B of the ULDR, and adoption of the findings of fact in the Staff Report. Conditions:

- 1. All glass shall be clear and all muntins shall have a raised profile.
- 2. This application is subject to the approval of Building, Zoning, and all ULDR requirements.

In a voice vote, motion to approve with conditions passed 6-0.

Case Number	H19023	FMSF# BD02865
Owner	Dawn McCann	
Applicant	Dawn McCann	
Address	1205 W. Las Olas Boulevard	
General Location	Approximately 80 feet west of the corner of SW 12th Avenue and West Las Olas Boulevard on the north side of the street	
Legal Description	WAVERLY PLACE 2-19 D LOT 3,4 & S1/2 OF VAC ALLEY ABUTTING SAID LOTS BLK 110	
Existing Use	Single-Family Residential	
Proposed Use	Single-Family Residential	
Zoning	RML-25	
Applicable ULDR Sections	47-24.11.C.3.c.i, 47-17.7.B	
Authored By	Trisha Logan, Urban Planner III	

# **REQUEST:** Certificate of Appropriateness for Minor Alteration

• Installation of new windows and doors throughout; alteration to the size of select openings; and small addition to the rear of the structure.

[See staff report attached hereto]

Ms. Logan reviewed the staff report and concluded with:

In accordance with Sections 47-24.11.C.3.c.i and 47-17.7.B of the ULDR, staff finds that the application for a COA for minor alterations for the installation of new windows and doors throughout; alteration to the size of select openings; and small addition to the rear of the structure under case number H19023 located at 1205 W. Las Olas Boulevard meets the criteria as outlined in Sections 47-24.11.C.3.c.i. of the ULDR, partially meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, and partially meets the criterion for consideration of window and door materials as listed under 47-17.7.B.2.a. of the ULDR.

The following conditions are provided for consideration by the HPB if the application is to be approved:

 This application is subject to the approval by Building, Zoning, and all ULDR requirements.

Dawn McCann, owner, said she wanted to replace vinyl windows that had been damaged last year in a fire. She wanted the double French door in the rear for symmetry. Ms.

McCann added that they could only find vinyl double-hung windows. Jody Aikens, Ms. McCann's husband, confirmed that only vinyl double-hung windows were available. He said all but one window in the home now were double hung. Window #14 was a casement window.

Ms. Mammano wanted to approve this application with the vinyl windows and then deal with perhaps changing the ordinance, which specified aluminum and vinyl-clad wood for windows.

Chair Figler opened the public input portion of the meeting. There being no one present wishing to address the Board on this matter, Chair Figler closed the public hearing and brought the discussion back to the Board.

**Motion** made by Mr. Rosa, seconded by Ms. Mammano to recommend:

**Approval** of the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness under case number H19023 located at 1205 W. Las Olas Boulevard for minor alterations for the installation of new windows and doors throughout; alteration to the size of select openings; and small addition to the rear of the structure, based on a finding these requests are consistent with the Criteria for Certificates of Appropriateness in Section 47-24.11.C.3.c.i of the ULDR, are consistent with the purpose and intent of the Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation, and are consistent with the Sailboat Bend material and design guidelines in Section 47-17.7.B. of the ULDR, and adoption of the findings of fact of the Staff Report. Condition:

 This application is subject to the approval of Building, Zoning, and all ULDR requirements.

In a voice vote, motion to approve with a condition passed 6-0.

### V. Communication to the City Commission

Index

Ms. Mammano asked what they needed to include vinyl as an appropriate material for windows in the Material and Design Guidelines for Sailboat Bend and the Historic Preservation Design guidelines. Ms. Wallen stated Ms. Logan could bring the recommendations to her superiors and this could be passed as a separate ordinance. She recommended the Board send a communication to the City Commission regarding this proposal. Chair Figler stated there were inferior and superior vinyl windows; aluminum windows were more consistent in quality. Miami-Dade wind codes could be used for this criterion.

Ms. Mammano made a motion, seconded by Mr. Marcus, to send the following communication to the City Commission:

The Board recommends staff consider making a change to the ordinance to permit vinyl windows that meet hurricane qualifications in accordance with the Miami-Dade requirements to make these permissible in the Sailboat Bend Historic District for replacement and new construction. In a voice vote, motion passed 6-0.

## VI. Good of the City

Index

Ms. Logan provided an update on the proposed ULDR amendments:

- There were now 9 members of the HPB with 5 members needed for a quorum.
- Three amendments to the Historic Preservation ordinance are scheduled to be on the City Commission's August 20, 2019, agenda.
- The Planning and Zoning Board had voted to recommend the parking amendments discussed at the HPB's June meeting and these are scheduled for the City Commission's September 3, 2019, meeting.

Mr. Schiavone asked how they could notify home buyers when a property they were considering purchasing was in a historic district. He thought this information might be incorporated into the legal description of a property on the Broward County Property Appraiser's website. Ms. Mammano stated the Property Appraiser's office Liaison, Bob Wolfe, attended many neighborhood meetings and suggested inviting him to an HPB meeting to discuss this. Ms. Logan agreed to put this on a future agenda.

## **Adjournment**

There being no further business to come before the Board, the meeting was adjourned at 6:20 p.m.

Attest:

ProtoType Inc. Recording Secretary

Chairman

George Figler Chair

The City of Fort Lauderdale maintains a <u>website</u> for the Historic Preservation Board Meeting Agendas and Results:

http://www.fortlauderdale.gov/departments/city-clerk-s-office/board-and-committee-agendas-and-minutes/historic-preservation-board

Any written public comments made 48 hours prior to the meeting regarding items discussed during the proceedings have been attached hereto.