

# HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE MONDAY, NOVEMBER 4, 2019 - 5:00 P.M. CITY HALL COMMISSION CHAMBERS 100 NORTH ANDREWS AVENUE FORT LAUDERDALE, FLORIDA

# Cumulative Attendance 6/2019 through 5/2020

| Board Members                          | <b>Attendance</b> | <u>Present</u> | <u>Absent</u> |
|--|-------------------|----------------|---------------|
| George Figler, Chair                   | Р                 | 4              | 1             |
| Jason Blank, Vice Chair [Arrived 5:03] | Р                 | 4              | 1             |
| Caldwell Cooper                        | Р                 | 2              | 0             |
| Marilyn Mammano                        | Р                 | 4              | 1             |
| Donna Mergenhagen                      | P                 | 3              | 2             |
| Arthur Marcus                          | Р                 | 5              | 0             |
| David Parker                           | Р                 | 5              | 0             |
| Richard Rosa                           | Р                 | 3              | 2             |
| Tim Schiavone                          | Р                 | 5              | 0             |

### City Staff

Shari Wallen, Assistant City Attorney Trisha Logan, Urban Planner III Yvonne Redding, Urban Planner III Jamie Opperlee, Recording Secretary, Prototype Inc.

| Inc | lex    | Owner/Applicant   | Page |
|-----|--------|---|------|
| 1.  | H19016 | Kim Nothard   | 2    |
| 2.  | H19029 | URBN Flagler LLC and Third Avenue Development, LLC/Courtney Crush | 4    |
|     |        | Communication to the City Commission                              | 6    |
|     |        | Good of the City  | 6    |

### I. Call to Order/Pledge of Allegiance

The meeting of the Historic Preservation Board was called to order at 5:00 p.m.

# II. <u>Determination of Quorum/Approval of Minutes</u>

Roll was called and it was determined a quorum was present.

Mr. Cooper requested a change to the minutes.

**Motion** made by Mr. Mammano, seconded by Mr. Marcus to approve the minutes of the Board's October 2019 meeting as amended. In a voice vote, motion passed 8-0.

## III. <u>Public Sign-in/Swearing-In</u>

All members of the public wishing to address the Board on any item were sworn in.

Board members disclosed communications and site visits for each agenda item.

## IV. Agenda Items:

1. <u>Index</u>

Deferred from September 4, 2019.

## **REQUEST:**

Certificate of Appropriateness for Major Alteration

• Exterior alterations on northwest façade of garage structure to remove existing garage doors and windows; enclosure of portions of the wall; installation of new doors and windows; installation of flood barriers; and site improvements.

| Case Number                | H19016   | FMSF# | BD04551 |
|----------------------------|--|-------|---------|
| Owner                      | Kim Nothard  |       |         |
| Applicant                  | Kim Nothard  |       |         |
| Address                    | 215 SW 14 <sup>th</sup> Way  |       |         |
| General Location           | Northwest corner of SW 14 <sup>th</sup> Way and SW 2 <sup>nd</sup> Court   |       |         |
| Legal Description          | RIVER HIGHLANDS 10-3 B LOTS 1,2 BLK 2 & TOGETHER WITH W1/2<br>OF VAC POR OF SW 14TH WAY LYING E & ADJ TO SAID LOTS |       |         |
| Existing Use               | Single-Family Residential  |       |         |
| Proposed Use               | Single-Family Residential  |       |         |
| Zoning                     | RS-8   |       |         |
| Applicable ULDR Sections   | 47-24.11.C.3.c.i; 47-24.11.C.3.c.ii; 47-17.7.B   |       |         |
| Landmark/Historic District | Sailboat Bend Historic District  |       |         |
| Authored By                | risha Logan, Urban Planner III   |       |         |

[See staff report attached hereto]

Ms. Logan reviewed the staff report, which concluded with:

In accordance with Sections 47-24.11.D.3.c.i, 47-24.11.D.3.c.ii and 47-17.7.B of the ULDR, staff finds that the application for a COA for minor alterations under case number H19016 located at 215 SW 14<sup>th</sup> Way meets the criteria as outlined in Section 47-24.11.C.3.c.i. of the ULDR, meets the criterion in the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, a meet the criterion as outlined in Sections 47-24.11.C.3.c.ii. of the ULDR, and meets the criterion for consideration of window and door materials as listed under 47-17.7.B.2.a. of the ULDR.

The following conditions are provided for consideration by the HPB if the application is to be approved:

- 1. All new wall finishes shall match the existing of the adjacent wall surface on both the first and second floors.
- 2. In accordance with Section 47-25.5P, Fort Lauderdale U.L.D.R, a Phase I Survey of the subject property should be performed prior to any ground disturbance activities. The survey should be

designed to identify any archaeological resources located within the area of ground disturbing work and to identify characterize the presence of any archaeological deposits with this section.

- a. The survey shall be conducted by archaeological professionals who meet the Secretary of the Interior professional standards (36 CFR part 61 as amended) and all work shall conform to Chapter 267, Florida Statutes and the professional Standards set forth in Chapter 1A-46 Florida Administrative Code.
- b. Fieldwork shall include systematic, high-interval archaeological testing of the entire subject property including a minimum of three shovel tests placed within the area of proposed development.
- c. A final survey report shall be submitted to the Historic Preservation Board Liaison, Trisha Logan (tlogan@fortlauderdale.gov / 954-828-7101) for review of completion, determination of effects and/or significance, and approval or approval with conditions. The report should include an assessment and characterization of all historic/archaeological resources identified within the parcel, proposed or recommended management or mitigation strategies, and identification of the disposition of recovered archaeological collections as appropriate. The finding presented in the Final Report will be utilized to inform what, if any, additional requirements / recommendations may be required prior to development approval.
- d. All work shall conform to the "guidelines for identification, evaluation, recordation, and treatment of cultural resources" set forth in Module Three of the Florida Division of Historical Resource's Cultural Resource Management Standards and Operational Manual.

In the event that unmarked human remains are encountered then excavation in the vicinity of the find shall halt immediately and the archaeologist shall alert the City's historic preservation staff to coordinate the discovery and take measures to implement Chapter 872.05 Florida Statutes as it pertains to the discovery of unmarked human remains.

3. This application is subject to the approval by Building, Zoning, and all ULDR requirements.

Margi Nothard said after reviewing the staff report, they had addressed staff's concerns and modified the application accordingly. She invited questions.

Chair Figler asked about the sliding glass door materials and Ms. Nothard said they would use the same finish as the upstairs doors; aluminum.

Ms. Nothard descried the flood barrier to the Board.

Chair Figler opened the public input portion of the meeting. There being no one present wishing to address the Board on this matter, Chair Figler closed the public hearing and brought the discussion back to the Board.

**Motion** made by Mr. Marcus, seconded by Mr. Cooper, to approve the resolution for a Certificate of Appropriateness under case number H19016 located at 215 SW 14th Way for major alterations to include the staff conditions, based on facts and findings as outlined in the staff memorandum.

In a voice vote, motion passed 9-0.

2.

### **REQUEST:**

Historic Preservation Board Review and Comment on proposed new development - URBN at Flagler Village, adjacent to designated Historic Landmark First Evangelical Lutheran Church

| Case Number              | H19029 <b>FMSF#</b>  |  |  |
|--------------------------|--|--|--|
| Owner                    | URBN Flagler LLC and Third Avenue Development, LLC   |  |  |
| Applicant                | Courtney Crush, Crush Law P.A.   |  |  |
| Address                  | 421 - 441 NE 3rd Avenue  |  |  |
| General Location         | Southwest corner of NE 3 Avenue and NE 5 Street  |  |  |
| Legal Description        | Designated Portion: LOTS 1 AND 2, LESS EAST 5 FET, BLOCK 29, NORTH LAUDERDALE AMENDED PLAT, ACCORDING TO THE PLAT THEREOF, AS RECORDED IN PLAT BOOK 1, PAGE 182 OF THE PUBLIC RECORDS OF DADE COUNTY, FLORIDA  Entire Property: NORTH LAUDERDALE AMMENDED PLAT 1-182D LOTS 1-7, LESS E5 FOR ST, BLK 29 |  |  |
| Existing Use             | Former Church (now vacant)   |  |  |
| Proposed Use             | Mixed-use  |  |  |
| Zoning                   | RAC-CC   |  |  |
| Applicable ULDR Sections | City of Fort Lauderdale Comprehensive Plan (Ordinance C-15-08)<br>Volume I – Historic Preservation Element   |  |  |
| Authored By              | Trisha Logan, Urban Planner III  |  |  |

[See staff report attached hereto]

Ms. Logan reviewed the staff report, which concluded with:

With the physical separation between the two structures, setbacks provided, as well as measures taken for the new development to complement the historic landmark, the perceived level of adverse effects is minimized. Staff would suggest that the following condition be taken into consideration:

1. Staging for the new construction project shall not negatively impact the adjacent historic structure and protection from construction debris and construction equipment shall be provided, as necessary. A protection plan must be submitted to the Historic Preservation Board Liaison prior to applying for building permits.

Courtney Crush, attorney, gave a Power Point presentation of the materials provided in the board member packets.

Mr. Blank liked the design and the incorporation of color in the new construction.

Ms. Crush explained that the landscape plan had been updated since the rendering in the Power Point was created. She informed the Board that the church would be used for dining and perhaps performance space.

Jean Francois Gervais, architect, clarified various distances between the buildings.

Mr. Marcus was concerned that the colorful wall adjacent to the church would take focus away from the historic structure. Mr. Gervais explained how they had tried to relate the design of the new construction to the church building.

Ms. Mergenhagen liked creating a continuum with the glass component but felt it was jarring going from the palette of the church to the pastel palette of the new wall.

Ms. Mammano said she had originally been appalled by this design but upon reflection, she felt it made a lot of sense. Ms. Crush agreed the color palette could be made to more closely reflect the palette of the stained glass windows.

Chair Figler opened the public input portion of the meeting.

Robin Merrill was concerned because the church had been in a derelict condition for many years. She stated her non-profit had been a tenant in the building years ago she had found the stained glass restorer for the windows years ago. She recalled when the windows had been removed after the application for designation had been submitted and said if her group had not been involved, "you would not have seen those stained glass windows ever again." Ms. Merrill noted that the church had a story and she wanted to be sure that this was preserved and incorporated into the redevelopment.

Mr. Marcus said a plaque could be affixed to the church describing its history. Ms. Merrill noted that there had been a plaque but it had been removed. Ms. Merrill felt there was more of a story to be told and this should include other media. Ms. Mammano suggested recording interviews with people who knew the stories of the church.

Mr. Logan stated there was an interactive online "story map" available via the Historic Preservation website that described Fort Lauderdale's historic landmarks. This could be viewed using a cell phone. Ms. Logan stated the map could include additional links but she was not sure about videos specifically.

Mr. Schiavone suggested Ms. Merrill create a Facebook page and the input collected on it could be used elsewhere. Ms. Merrill stated they already had one, but she wanted the information moved to a City-sanctioned space.

Mr. Schiavone congratulated the applicant for creating a project that would provide an economic engine to maintain the historic building and allow people to experience the church like a museum.

Ms. Merrill said she liked the design, but also wished the colors of the new construction to mimic those in the church stained glass.

 $\underline{http://www.fortlauderdale.gov/departments/city-clerk-s-office/board-and-committee-agendas-and-minutes/historic-preservation-board}$ 

Any written public comments made 48 hours prior to the meeting regarding items discussed during the proceedings have been attached hereto.

There being no one else present wishing to address the Board on this matter, Chair Figler closed the public hearing.

V. Communication to the City Commission

Index

None

VI. Good of the City

Index

3. Discussion of Public Records Request made at the October 7, 2019, Historic Preservation Board Meeting for Letter Regarding Bonnet House.

Ms. Mammano wondered what the Board's role would be in this issue.

Mr. Schiavone had requested the letter so the Board could ask the City Commission to support keeping the current management of the Bonnet House. He admitted the issue was becoming very confusing and politically complicated.

Board members discussed whether the Board should provide input to the City Commission regarding support for Mayor Trantalis's direction and how they could better educate themselves about the issue described in Mayor Trantalis's letter to Governor DeSantis.

Mr. Blank suggested the Board wait until December to make a decision about a recommendation; this would allow them time to educate themselves better about the situation.

**Motion** made by Mr. Blank, seconded by Ms. Mammano to put this item on the Board's December agenda. In a voice vote, motion passed 9-0.

4. 2020 Meeting Schedule Discussion and Adoption: September to be held on Tuesday, September 8, 2020.

**Motion** made by Ms. Mammano, seconded by Ms. Mergenhagen to approve the Board's 2020 meeting schedule. In a voice vote, motion passed 9-0.

Adjournment

There being no further business to come before the Board, the meeting was adjourned at 6:32 p.m.

Attest:

ProtoType Inc. Recording Secretary

Chairman:

George Figler, Chair

The City of Fort Lauderdale maintains a <u>website</u> for the Historic Preservation Board Meeting Agendas and Results: