

MEETING MINUTES CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE PLANNING AND ZONING BOARD WEDNESDAY, JUNE 17, 2020 – 6:00 P.M.

Cumulative

June 2020-May 2021

Board Members	Attendance	Present	Absent
Catherine Maus, Chair	P	1	0
Mary Fertig, Vice Chair	P	1	0
John Barranco	P	1	0
Brad Cohen (6:20-10:24)	P	1	0
Coleman Prewitt	P	1	0
William Rotella	P	1	0
Jacquelyn Scott	P	1	0
Jay Shechtman	P	1	0
Michael Weymouth	P	1	0

It was noted that a quorum was present at the meeting.

Staff

Ella Parker, Urban Design and Planning Manager D'Wayne Spence, Assistant City Attorney Shari Wallen, Assistant City Attorney Jim Hetzel, Principal Planner Nicholas Kalargyros, Urban Design and Planning Trisha Logan, Urban Design and Planning Adam Schnell, Urban Design and Planning Benjamin Restrepo, Transportation and Mobility Igor Vassiliev, Public Works Brigitte Chiappetta, Recording Secretary, Prototype, Inc.

Communications to City Commission

None.

I. CALL TO ORDER / PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Chair Maus called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m. Roll was called and the Pledge of Allegiance was recited.

The following Item was taken out of order on the Agenda.

III. ELECTION OF BOARD CHAIR / VICE CHAIRPERSON

Motion made by Vice Chair Fertig, seconded by Ms. Scott, to nominate Catherine Maus [as Chair]. In a voice vote, the **motion** passed unanimously.

Motion made by Mr. Shechtman, seconded by Ms. Scott, to nominate Mary Fertig as Vice Chair. In a voice vote, the **motion** passed unanimously.

II. APPROVAL OF MINUTES / DETERMINATION OF QUORUM

Motion made by Mr. Prewitt, seconded by Vice Chair Fertig, to approve the minutes of the May 20, 2020 meeting. In a voice vote, the **motion** passed unanimously.

IV. PUBLIC SIGN-IN / SWEARING-IN

Members of the public wishing to speak on any Item on tonight's Agenda were sworn in at this time.

V. AGENDA ITEMS

Index

	Case Number	Applicant
1.	R18025**	KT Seabreeze Atlantic, LP
2.	R19035**	Homewood Suites by Hilton
3.	PL19002**	3001 N Ocean LLC
4.	R19046**	Davie 1
5.	PDD19002**	Towers Retirement Home, Incorporated
6.	PLN-REZ-20020001* **	Sunshine Shipyard, LLC

Special Notes:

Local Planning Agency (LPA) items (*) – In these cases, the Planning and Zoning Board will act as the Local Planning Agency (LPA). Recommendation of approval will include a finding of consistency with the City's Comprehensive Plan and the criteria for rezoning (in the case of rezoning requests).

Quasi-Judicial items (**) – Board members disclose any communication or site visit they have had pursuant to Section 47-1.13 of the ULDR. All persons speaking on quasi-judicial matters will be sworn in and will be subject to cross-examination.

Chair Maus noted that the Applicant of Item 1 had requested deferral to the September 16, 2020 meeting.

Motion made by Ms. Scott, seconded by Vice Chair Fertig, to grant the deferral. In a voice vote, the **motion** passed unanimously.

Chair Maus introduced the Board members, and Urban Design and Planning Manager Ella Parker introduced the Staff members present.

Motion made by Vice Chair Fertig, seconded by Ms. Scott, to hear Items 2 and 3 presented together and vote [on them] separately. In a voice vote, the **motion** passed unanimously.

Ms. Parker advised that a member of the public had requested to speak on Item 1. It was determined that the speaker would be heard before Items 2 and 3 were addressed.

Keith Poliakoff, representing the Alhambra Place Condominium Association, advised that he had submitted a letter to the Board regarding Item 1. He recalled that members of this association came before the Planning and Zoning Board on December 18, 2020 to request that the Item not be continued to today's meeting, as it has been continued several times already. This puts the Association in a difficult position, as members do not receive individual notices of when the Item may come back before the Board.

Mr. Poliakoff continued that the developer and Applicant's counsel have submitted a second application for the development of the subject property in Item 1. As a result, neither the Association nor the larger community can easily determine which application is being considered at a meeting. He concluded that the Association requests this Item not be deferred again, and that the Applicant be required to re-apply for consideration if they wish to move the project forward. Should the deferral be granted, the Association asks that the developer be required to notify all property owners of the new date.

Chair Maus asked if the Board is permitted to entertain a **motion** to reconsider deferral of Item 1. Assistant City Attorney Shari Wallen confirmed that this may be done.

Ms. Scott proposed that the **motion** to defer be changed to include the caveat that the Applicant's team is required to provide notice. Stephanie Toothaker, representing the Applicant of Item 1, advised that a second set of plans for the subject property will come before the Board, and the Applicant will send certified notices to property owners of Alhambra Place and other owners within 300 ft. of the project.

Chair Maus asked if the Applicant plans to move forward with existing plans for the project. Ms. Toothaker explained that because residents of Alhambra Place had expressed concern for the previously submitted Site Plan, changes have been made to the Site Plan, including shifting the location of towers and building structures with fewer units.

Chair Maus also asked if Staff considers the Applicant of Item 1 to have submitted two different Site Plans. Jim Hetzel, Principal Planner, replied that the two plans are submitted under separate case numbers. The second application is considered to be separate from the first.

Motion made by Ms. Scott, seconded by Vice Chair Fertig, to reconsider the original motion for deferral. In a voice vote, the motion passed 7-1 (Mr. Barranco dissenting).

Mr. Cohen joined the meeting at 6:20 p.m.

Motion made by Ms. Scott, seconded by Mr. Cohen, to grant the deferral and have the Applicant make sure that they communicate directly [with] the condominium so that they get the information in time.

Vice Chair Fertig proposed the following amendment to the motion: to provide notice to anybody within 300 ft. or whatever the notice requirement would be. Ms. Scott accepted the amendment.

In a voice vote, the motion passed 8-1 (Mr. Barranco dissenting).

2. CASE: R19035

> Site Plan Level III Review: 106,980 Square-Foot, 106-REQUEST: **

Room Hotel Exceeding 10,000 Square Feet in Community

Business Zoning District

PROPERTY

OWNER/APPLICANT:

AGENT:

PROJECT NAME:

GENERAL LOCATION:

ABBREVIATED LEGAL

DESCRIPTION:

Stephanie Toothaker

3001 N Ocean LLC

Homewood Suites by Hilton

3001 N Ocean Boulevard A portion of Lots 94 and 95, Block 1, Lauderdale Beach,

according to the plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 4, Page 2, of the Public Records of Broward County, Florida

Lauderdale

COMMISSION DISTRICT:

NEIGHBORHOOD ASSOCIATION:

ZONING DISTRICT:

LAND USE: CASE PLANNER: Community Business (CB)

Commercial

3001 N Ocean LLC.

Adam Schnell

2 - Steven Glassman

DEFERRED FROM MAY 20, 2020

Central Beach Alliance Homeowners Association

3. CASE: PL19002 REQUEST: ** Plat Review

PROPERTY OWNER/APPLICANT:

AGENT:

Jim McLaughlin, McLaughlin Engineering Co.

Gummakonda Plat PROJECT NAME:

3001 N Ocean Boulevard GENERAL LOCATION:

A portion of Lots 94 and 95, Block 1, Lauderdale Beach, ABBREVIATED LEGAL according to the plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 4, DESCRIPTION:

Page 2, of the Public Records of Broward County, Florida

Lauderdale

COMMISSION DISTRICT: NEIGHBORHOOD 2 - Steven Glassman

ASSOCIATION:

Central Beach Alliance Homeowners Association

ZONING DISTRICT:

Community Business (CB)

LAND USE:

Commercial

CASE PLANNER:

Nicholas Kalargyros

DEFERRED FROM MAY 20, 2020

Disclosures were made at this time.

Stephanie Toothaker, representing the Applicant, showed a PowerPoint presentation on Items 2 and 3, which are requests for Site Plan and plat approval. She advised that there is extensive history for this project, which is proposed as a 106-room hotel. The site is zoned Community Business (CB). The site is located north of the Central Beach District.

Ms. Toothaker continued that there have been two previous Site Plans for this project, including one that included a 16-unit residential project. After significant discussion before the Board, this aspect of the project was ultimately withdrawn after ongoing communication between the Applicant and residents of the surrounding area, who did not want residential use in a CB-zoned district.

The current Site Plan meets all provisions required within the CB zoning district. The project is a 106-room hotel, eight stories in height, with setbacks that meet or exceed requirements. The proposed building complies with ULDR parking requirements, providing 106 spaces. Entry to the building is set significantly back from Ocean Boulevard, with an elevated lobby/terrace and all activity internalized on the site. All mechanical equipment will be screened.

Because sewer capacity is a concern for Fort Lauderdale at present, the Applicant conducted a study to determine what would be generated by the project. Water, sewer, plant capacity, and the substation are expected to provide adequate service both before and after the project. There are no effects expected for tides, and road capacity will not change. The floor area ratio (FAR) for the proposed hotel is 4.9.

Ms. Toothaker continued that although nearby residents have expressed concern with the possibility of increased flooding and flow into pipes, less stormwater is expected to be generated. A drainage plan has been proposed to relieve existing issues on the site. The property will be required to retain any runoff through the use of drainage methodologies which will reduce water intrusion into the public right-of-way.

Because the project would generate fewer than 1000 daily trips, no traffic impact study was required. The site is expected to generate 192 daily trips, and the level of service on the roadway would not be affected. The building is 105 ft. in height, which is below the

maximum height allowed on the site. Surrounding uses include mixed-use commercial and multi-family.

The subject site was previously a gas station and is currently a vacant lot. Construction of the proposed hotel will create pedestrian-oriented street frontage on Ocean Boulevard, with ground floor activation including transparency into the entrance and foyer. A partially enclosed pool deck on the third floor will break up the building's façade. Balconies are planned on both Ocean Boulevard and NE 30th Street.

The project's FAR is consistent with other nearby properties. Ms. Toothaker compared the proposed building to the Berkley South Condominium, noting that a shadow study of the planned Hilton property shows it would cast significantly smaller shadows on surrounding properties. Letters of support have been provided in the backup materials.

Motion made by Vice Chair Fertig, seconded by Mr. Shechtman, that the City Staff Report be included by record. In a voice vote, the **motion** passed unanimously.

It was clarified that the motion applied to both Staff Reports for Items 2 and 3.

There being no questions from the Board at this time, Chair Maus opened the public hearing for Items 2 and 3.

Eric Linder, president of the Board of Directors of the Berkley South Condominium Association, stated that this association is opposed to the Homewood Suites by Hilton project, as it is incompatible with the surrounding neighborhood. He pointed out that the project's density of 106 rooms on 0.41 acre is much greater than that of nearby buildings, including Berkley South, which has a density of 95 units per acre.

Mr. Linder continued that the Hilton project would cast a significant shadow on the Berkley South building. A shadow study commissioned by Berkley South is not consistent with the study provided by the Applicant. He briefly reviewed Berkley South's shadow study for the Board.

Jeffrey Tillari, president of the Tides at Bridgeside Square Condominiums, stated that residents of his condominium strongly oppose the proposed project. He reiterated that a project of this density on 0.41 acre would place significant stress on sewer pipes, recalling that the Board had requested an infrastructure study for the subject area. He pointed out that the City has experienced multiple sewer spills while already under a consent order dating back to 2015.

Mr. Tillari advised that although the subject location is within a tourist area that already experiences stormwater backup, this is overshadowed by wastewater issues. Wastewater pipes in the area have been found to have severe inflow, which leaves them vulnerable to intrusion from stormwater and groundwater. The area's basin operates at less than

75% capacity, and extra stress on the system can contribute to pipe erosion and breakage. Funding to improve the existing wastewater system is not expected until 2024.

Sherry Fitelson, private citizen, resident of the Tides Condominiums, stated that while she was in favor of development on the currently vacant lot, she felt the proposed density would result in too much pressure on the existing sewage system. She was also concerned with waste disposal trucks, which would have to back out onto 30th Street.

David Cowens, private citizen, felt the project is not compatible with the surrounding neighborhood and would have no positive effect on the community.

James Donnelly, private citizen, opposed the project, concurring with the concerns shared by previous speakers. He felt the proposed hotel would not serve the community and would have significant impact on the neighborhood. He also expressed concern for the project's rear yard setback of 16 ft. from the property line, stating that it should meet residential setback standards due to its proximity to a residential building.

Attorney Wallen requested that individuals who do not wish to speak but would like to indicate their opposition to the project raise their hands at this time, using the electronic system. She noted that all individuals have the right to speak if they wish to do so.

Steve Ganon, president of the Lauderdale Beach Homeowners' Association, stated that he represents a single-family residential neighborhood of approximately 120 properties across A1A. The Association's board has voted to oppose the project based on its density, compatibility, and setbacks. He characterized the zoning regulations which would permit the development as onerous and incompatible with the community.

Robert Dhein, private citizen, shared a video presentation with the Board showing the 18 ft. width of streets and 14 ft. height of the subject property's parking area in comparison with the height of garbage trucks and equipment. He reviewed City Ordinances addressing trash pickup and loading zones, which he stated were not consistent with the space provided by the proposed project.

Gregory Noll, private citizen, resident of the Tides Condominiums, advised that he opposed the project and concurred with the concerns shared by Mr. Tillari. His concerns included aging water and sewer pipes infrastructure in the subject neighborhood. He concluded that he questioned the veracity of the infrastructure report submitted by the Applicant.

William Brown, president of the Central Beach Alliance (CBA), reported that the CBA's general membership opposed the project by a vote of 236-15. He characterized 156 of the members as adamantly opposed, as they attended both CBA and condominium association meetings to vote against the project.

Stephen Sendelbeck, private citizen, resident of Berkley South Condominiums, stated that he opposed the project, which is not compatible with the definition of Community Business (CB). This zoning is intended for businesses that meet the shopping and service needs of the community. He also expressed concern with the density, size, scale, and lack of community support for the project.

James Santiago, private citizen, resident of the Tides Condominiums, advised that the proposed project does not meet the requirements for CB zoning, and expressed concerns for the safety of the surrounding community due to ongoing health concerns. He strongly opposed the project.

Val Lukshides, private citizen, opposed the project, stating that she was concerned for the traffic it would generate on the neighborhood's already congested streets, particularly on Ocean Boulevard. She felt environmental studies should be conducted in the area.

Shawn LaGrega, private citizen, opposed the project, noting that its footprint is very small with high density. He expressed concern that surrounding infrastructure may be insufficient for the project.

Peter Gallagher, private citizen, opposed the project, citing concern for its impact on traffic on NE 30th Street, which is already very congested. He was also concerned with the impact construction would have on an underlying aquifer.

Luise Lotz, private citizen, resident of the Tides Condominiums, opposed the project.

Rocco DiBruno, private citizen, stated that he opposed the project due to concern for the safety of nearby residents. He pointed out that other developments are coming to the area which will also contribute to density and infrastructure issues. He concluded that the project would not serve the interests of the surrounding community.

Carol Sossy, private citizen, resident of Berkley South Condominiums, opposed the project. She noted that hotels bring a transient population to neighborhoods, which can contribute to crime, and expressed concern for the project's impact on traffic. She concluded that the ground on which the project is planned has been contaminated from previous use and should be addressed prior to construction.

Mark Sheraton, private citizen, resident of Berkley South Condominiums, strongly opposed the project for many reasons, including zoning and neighborhood incompatibility as well as traffic concerns.

David Graves, private citizen, opposed the project, stating that he was concerned with the area's existing sewer and stormwater infrastructure problems, which would be strained further by the proposed development.

Linda Dicicco, private citizen, resident of the Tides Condominiums, opposed the project.

Melba and Al Amaro, private citizens, opposed the project. Ms. Amaro added that the owner of the subject property should be held accountable for maintenance of the space, as it is currently an eyesore.

The following private citizens indicated their opposition to the project without additional comment:

- Carol Jardine
- Glenn McAuley
- Sherry Davis
- James Ginster
- Arthur Edelstein
- John Rand
- Steve Parata
- Lou Trombiero
- Paul Nix
- Robert Schmidt
- Mark Schrayer
- Heidi El Tabakh
- Samar El Sallab
- John Roth
- Dario Badalamente
- Mark Abbott
- Michael Morhan
- Eric Miller
- Tony Schueth
- Daniel Brown
- Chris Chapman
- John Thompson
- Alfredo Vallenilla
- Pat Tarsi
- · Richard Buckheit
- Maureen Stoyka
- Greg Sampedro
- James Ginsberg
- Nancy Stelneck
- Lucy Greiner

As there were no other individuals wishing to speak on these Items, Chair Maus closed the public hearing and brought the discussion back to the Board.

Mr. Weymouth requested clarification of the estimated cost of development on the subject property. Ms. Toothaker replied that this is estimated at \$25 million. She noted that the

property is currently being used for parking by Berkley South Condominiums as well as 3030 Ocean Boulevard. Chair Maus reiterated the concern raised by a member of the public regarding cleanup of the site.

Mr. Shechtman recalled that several speakers had addressed the ULDR requirements for Community Business (CB) zoning, and asked how the proposed project would meet the needs of the surrounding community. Adam Schnell, representing Urban Design and Planning, stated that the project is subject to adequacy and neighborhood compatibility requirements; however, bulk requirements for density and FAR do not apply. The Department of Public Works has issued a letter in support of the development which states that no infrastructure improvements are needed. There is a low probability of archaeological findings on the property. He concluded that based upon surrounding uses and zoning districts, hotel use is not seen as incompatible with the community.

Ms. Toothaker addressed some of the concerns raised during public comment, pointing out that the proposed development shares the same land use and zoning as other surrounding properties, including the Tides, Galt Ocean, and Berkley South developments. She reiterated that the project is very small in comparison with these and other nearby properties and is an appropriate use. The traffic expected to be generated by the project was significantly below the 1000-trip threshold that would trigger a full traffic study.

Ms. Toothaker concluded that the Applicant continues to be willing to work with nearby residents to address their concerns where possible.

Vice Chair Fertig addressed the proposed hotel's density, noting that while other buildings in the area are larger, they also occupy larger parcels. Ms. Toothaker pointed out that hotels in CB zoning districts are not measured by density. Vice Chair Fertig also asked if the Applicant's team disputes the findings of the shadow study shared with the Board by a member of the public. Ms. Toothaker replied that the Applicant's shadow study measured shadows in four snapshots taken on the equinoxes or solstices; the study presented by Mr. Linder of Berkley South showed additional days within the same months. She advised that considering the shadows on specific seasonal days is standard procedure.

Vice Chair Fertig also asked how king tides are expected to affect the project, noting that flooding occurs in the subject area during tidal events. Ms. Toothaker stated that the Applicant's team conducted a thorough analysis to ensure that the project would not negatively affect nearby properties. The Hilton property will use its own system to address flooding.

Motion made by Ms. Scott, seconded by Mr. Cohen, to approve Item 2, Case Number R19035, based on the facts of the Staff Report and everything [the Board] heard tonight from Staff, including conditions on page[s] four and five of the Staff Report.

Attorney Wallen read the Resolution into the record:

A Resolution of the Planning and Zoning Board of the City of Fort Lauderdale, Florida, approving a Site Plan Level III development permit for the development known as Homewood Suites by Hilton, located at 3001 N Ocean Boulevard, Fort Lauderdale, Florida, in the Community Business zoning district for the development of a 106-unit hotel.

In a roll call vote, the motion passed 7-2 (Chair Maus and Vice Chair Fertig dissenting).

Motion made by Mr. Prewitt, seconded by Mr. Cohen, to approve the plat [Case 3, PL19002]. In a roll call vote, the **motion** passed 7-2 (Chair Maus and Vice Chair Fertig dissenting).

4. CASE: R19046

REQUEST: ** Site Plan Level III Review: Mixed-use Development

Requesting 1.11 Acres of Commercial Flexibility and Sixty (60) Residential Flexibility Units and a Development Exceeding 10,000 Square Feet in Community Business

Zoning District.

PROPERTY Davie 1, LLC

OWNER/APPLICANT:

AGENT: Shimon Buhadana, SB Construction

PROJECT NAME: Davie 1

GENERAL LOCATION: 3831 Davie Boulevard

ABBREVIATED LEGAL BRYSA Park 8-45 B Lots 14,15,16,17 Less M/L for ST RD 82

DESCRIPTION: BLK 8

COMMISSION DISTRICT: 3 - Robert L. McKinzie

NEIGHBORHOOD Lauderdale West Association

ASSOCIATION:

ZONING DISTRICT: Residential Multifamily Mid Rise/ Medium High Density

(RMM-25) and Community Business (CB)

LAND USE: Commercial and Medium-High

CASE PLANNER: Adam R. Schnell

Disclosures were made at this time.

Bill Henry, representing the Applicant, stated that the request is for a 60-unit mixed-use moderate-income project, intended as workforce housing, located on two acres with frontage onto Davie Boulevard. The parcel is zoned Residential with medium density (RMM-25) and Community Business (CB). Doug Yates, also representing the Applicant, reviewed a visual rendering of the area and surrounding uses.

Mr. Henry continued that the mid-rise project's two buildings will each have 30 units, which is below the maximum allowed. A landscape buffer is planned to lessen the project's

impact on residential structures to the north, including 174 new trees and over 1600 new shrubs. Parking is broken up on the site and buffered. The site includes a walkable area, with a plaza separating the two buildings. It is expected to generate fewer than 600 vehicle trips per day.

Chair Maus requested additional information regarding the landscaping screen on the northern border, including the varieties and heights of trees. Mr. Yates replied that some of the graphics of the landscape plan may not be accurate. He did not have all the requested information regarding trees, but noted that the Applicant is open to recommendations on plant materials. Shrubs beneath the trees will also contribute to the landscaping buffer.

Chair Maus asked if islands within the parking area are intended to include trees for additional shade. Mr. Yates advised that oak trees are planned for the islands.

Motion made by Mr. Shechtman, seconded by Vice Chair Fertig, to incorporate the City Staff Report into the record. In a voice vote, the **motion** passed unanimously.

There being no further questions from the Board at this time, Chair Maus opened the public hearing.

Chair Maus asked if the Applicant had made a presentation to civic associations in the subject area. Shimon Buhadana, also representing the Applicant, replied that two such meetings were held but no one attended them.

As there were no individuals wishing to speak on these Items, the Chair closed the public hearing and brought the discussion back to the Board.

Mr. Barranco observed that because the project includes mixed-use buildings, it is not a permitted right to expand parking into residential districts. Mr. Schnell of Urban Design and Planning recalled that there were internal conversations regarding whether or not the rear area of the site should be rezoned. Mr. Barranco continued that his concern was for the buffer, which would shield the adjacent residential neighborhood from the light cast by cars. He felt access to the parking area should be from the west rather than through the adjacent neighborhood as the area transitions from a business district to a residential district.

Chair Maus asked if it is possible to move both ingress and egress to and from the subject site to SW 39th Avenue, as well as whether or not the Applicant could erect a fence around the project's north perimeter with landscaping on its outside. It was clarified that traffic was intended to be separated in order to lessen the impact of the project; however, Mr. Henry advised that the Applicant is flexible on this issue and will defer to Staff.

Mr. Buhadana added that the main flow of traffic is from east to west. While he would prefer to provide a single ingress/egress point on 39th Avenue, this would affect potential

response times from the Fire Department as well as access to garbage trucks. If ingress/egress is changed, the Applicant would not be able to provide the same amount of landscaping without building a sidewalk. A water main is also located on the west side and cannot be encroached upon by landscaping.

Chair Maus requested additional information from Staff. Mr. Schnell advised that there are potential issues with the placement of a wall atop the water main. The Applicant is also subject to compatibility requirements on the east side of the property. He added that the proposed 5 ft. to 6 ft. wall is not a requirement.

Mr. Schnell continued that sugar maples are planned as part of the north perimeter buffer. He concluded that the Applicant plans to provide sufficient screening for the residential area to the north. The species of tree is dictated by proximity to drains as well as to overhead power lines.

Motion made by Mr. Barranco, seconded by Vice Chair Fertig, to approve [Item 4, Case R19046] with Staff conditions, based upon findings of fact and the Staff Report.

Attorney Wallen read the Resolution into the record:

A Resolution of the Planning and Zoning Board of the City of Fort Lauderdale, Florida, approving a Conditional Use Permit for the mixed-use development known as Davie 1, allocating 60 residential flex units on 1.1 acres of commercial flex acreage located at 3831 Davie Boulevard, Fort Lauderdale, Florida in the Community Business and Residential Multi-Family Mid-Rise/Medium High Density zoning district.

In a roll call vote, the motion passed 9-0.

5. CASE: PDD19002

Site Plan Level IV Review: Rezoning from Residential Multifamily Mid- Rise / Medium-High Density (RMM-25)

District to Planned Development District (PDD) with Site

Plan Approval for 39 Multifamily Residential Units

PROPERTY

OWNER/APPLICANT: Towers Retirement Home, Incorporated

AGENT: Robert Lochrie, Lochrie & Chakas P.A.

PROJECT NAME: Towers Place at Las Olas

GENERAL LOCATION: 824 SE 2nd Street

ABBREVIATED LEGAL Lots 1-4 of Block 8, Beverly Heights, Plat Book 1, Page 30

DESCRIPTION: of the Public Records of Broward County

COMMISSION DISTRICT: 2 - Steven Glassman

ZONING DISTRICT: Residential Multifamily Mid Rise/Medium High Density

(RMM-25)

PROPOSED ZONING: Planned Development District (PDD)

LAND USE: Medium-High Density Residential
CASE PLANNER: Jim Hetzel

Disclosures were made at this time. Ms. Scott recused herself from hearing or voting upon the Item due to a business conflict.

Robert Lochrie, representing the Applicant, stated that the request is for Site Plan Level IV Review of a building constructed in 1925. It has had several uses over the years, most recently as a retirement home. It was designated a historic resource by the Fort Lauderdale City Commission in 2015.

The property includes two structures: a main building on SE 2nd Street south of the Himmarshee Canal, and a smaller annex building that also contains residential uses. The property will contain 39 residential units, which is the same number for which it was originally built. The developer's plans include retaining the entire main building, which has been repurposed inside for larger rooms. A new building has been constructed in the same general location as the annex building.

The Applicant has also addressed parking on the property to bring it into compliance with current parking standards for a historic property. A pool/amenity area has been added in the rear of the property.

The proposal before the Board includes rezoning the property to Planned Development District (PDD). Because the 39 units were slightly enlarged, some were relocated into the new four-story building. Parking is on-site and has been brought up to Code, with additional parking permitted on SE 2nd Street. This is consistent with the patterns of development to the east and west of the property. Additional landscaping improvements will be placed throughout the site and along SE 2nd Street and the Himmarshee Canal.

The project was reviewed and approved by the City's Historic Preservation Board (HPB) in January 2020, which granted three Certificates of Appropriateness: one for the restoration of the main building, one for the demolition of the non-contributing annex building, and one for the construction of a new building.

A number of elements have been added and changes made to the building over the years. The Applicant has worked with City consultants to determine these changes, which include use of different materials, landscaping, and other enhancements to the historic building, including a courtyard that has been reimagined for this project. The HPB has requested that the parking be buffered by additional landscaping in front of the building.

Mr. Lochrie continued that the south side of the site will include a public amenity area, a pool area, shade trees, and other plants. He emphasized that one aspect of PDD zoning is the restoration of the historic structure. Neighbors of the property requested that the Applicant restore a historic path along the north-south street adjacent to the waterway. The Applicant has further agreed to enhance this walkway by providing a stamped asphalt

surface designed to resemble pavers. Landscaping will be added where there is sufficient space.

Mr. Lochrie advised that the maximum height in the PDD zoning district is 55 ft., which allows buildings of up to six stories. The Applicant plans to "downzone" the property by reducing its height to 46 ft. 6 in. They also plan to reconfigure the parking: at present, the property has only 10 parking spaces, which will be increased to 39 spaces. Recent Code Amendments applied to historic properties permit one parking space per unit. The Applicant is also requesting an additional provision for the landscaped and open space areas to permit the amenity area.

Mr. Lochrie continued that while the existing building provides a 25 ft. front setback from the street, which meets Code, its east side is set back only 15 ft. rather than the required 25 ft. PDD zoning would provide for the 15 ft. setback. The Applicant proposes a 5 ft. setback from the property line on the west and south sides of the building.

Mr. Lochrie advised that the project has been presented to the appropriate neighborhood association, as well as to direct neighbors. The Applicant has received a number of letters of support. They have reviewed the Staff Report and agree with all the proposed conditions.

The project will include bike racks. Because nearby single-family homes include garages in their rear area, the Applicant will plant either fishtail palms, another type of palm tree, or cypress trees. The Board encouraged the Applicant's team to increase the landscaping in this area.

Chair Maus expressed concern that the project's parking would spill over into the surrounding neighborhood, which may not be able to absorb it. Mr. Lochrie stated that the subject neighborhood has permit parking, which could allow residents of the property to secure additional permits. Without these permits, the residents would be subject to the same requirements as other residents, including registration to park on the street or during specific hours.

Motion made by Vice Chair Fertig, seconded by Mr. Shechtman, to incorporate the Staff Report into the record. In a voice vote, the **motion** passed unanimously.

Ms. Parker advised that Staff sent all Board members an updated Staff Report earlier in the day. The report has also been updated on the City's website. It included minor modifications to p.5, table 2.

There being no questions from the Board at this time, Chair Maus opened the public hearing.

Mark Nelson, private citizen, stated that his family has owned the subject property since 1969. It has taken significant time to find a developer who was able to design an economically viable solution for the property.

Rabbi Chaim Slavaticki, private citizen, resident of Downtown Fort Lauderdale, advised that he is supportive of the project, which will restore a currently dilapidated property.

David Abers, private citizen, resident of Downtown Fort Lauderdale, felt the project will beautify the area and make it more walkable while retaining the building's historic character.

Dominic Annecca, private citizen, resident of Downtown Fort Lauderdale, also characterized the property's current state as dilapidated, and felt the project will restore its value and create jobs.

Jean-Pierre Breier, private citizen, advised that he lives next door to the property on the west side of the proposed four-story building. He was disappointed in his meeting with the Applicant's team, as they have not addressed the issues he raised, including the location of its garbage dumpster and the need for more landscaping to separate the two properties. He concluded that more parking was needed on the subject site.

Mr. Lochrie addressed Mr. Breier's concerns, stating that the Applicant's team had wanted the garbage dumpster in a particular location on the site, which is close to the adjacent building's dumpster; however, City Staff had not wanted to place a dumpster on 2nd Street. In addition, the subject site would have lost two parking spaces if the 2nd Street location was used. A wall and landscaping are planned for the dumpster area to shield it from the neighbors to the west. He advised that the location could be changed if that is the Board's desire and if City Staff agrees to a change.

Lynne Winters, private citizen, stated that while she was happy with the design of the site, she had concerns about the site's parking, which she estimated would provide 32 to 33 spaces rather than 39. There is also no space on the site designated for delivery or service trucks. She added that the height of the proposed four-story building would place her two-story building next door in shadow for a large portion of the day.

Motion made by Vice Chair Fertig, seconded by Mr. Weymouth, to exceed [the Board's] 10 o'clock deadline. In a voice vote, the **motion** passed unanimously.

Rick Yazback, private citizen, stated that he lives in the town homes next door to the subject site. He felt Mr. Breier and Ms. Winters had expressed his concerns during their comments.

Chair Maus requested additional information on the annex building, which is currently two stories in height. Mr. Lochrie advised that zoning for the eastern half of the property, currently RMM-25, permits up to 55 ft. in height, which is taller than the proposed four-

story building. He asserted that the proposed height of 46 ft. would be the lowest height within approximately 300 ft. The western half of the property is zoned Regional Activity Center (RAC).

Chair Maus proposed that when a motion is made on the Item, the Board may wish to make it clear that they do not oppose locating the garbage dumpster on 2nd Street.

As there were no other individuals wishing to speak on these Items, Chair Maus closed the public hearing and brought the discussion back to the Board.

Mr. Weymouth observed that because the City owns the piece of property between the roadway and the canal, he would recommend that the Board ensure the Applicant is not responsible for this area. Mr. Lochrie agreed with this suggestion.

Chair Maus recalled that the City recently passed an Ordinance requiring property owners to raise the heights of their seawalls under certain conditions, and asked if this would apply to the renovation of the subject property. Jim Hetzel, representing Urban Design and Planning, replied that the Applicant would not be responsible for the seawall, as the property does not directly abut the waterway.

Vice Chair Fertig requested confirmation that the Applicant has sought support for the project from the surrounding neighborhood. Mr. Lochrie replied that the Applicant's team met with residents of the adjacent town homes as well as the appropriate neighborhood association. Notice was provided to all neighboring properties within 300 ft.

Mr. Hetzel addressed the issue of the garbage dumpster, pointing out that City Code prevents placement of a dumpster on street frontage. He suggested that the Board's **motion** request that City Staff work with the Applicant to find an appropriate location for the dumpster within Code. Ms. Parker confirmed that Staff would work with the Applicant's team and neighbors of the property to identify a workable solution.

Motion made by Vice Chair Fertig, seconded by Mr. Cohen, to approve Case no. PDD19002 with the Staff conditions, and with the understanding/agreement that the Applicant will do their best job and the City will work with them and the neighbors to resolve the issues with the garbage. In a roll call vote, the **motion** passed 8-0. (Ms. Scott abstained. A memorandum of voting conflict is attached to these minutes.)

Ms. Scott rejoined the meeting at this time.

Mr. Cohen left the meeting at 10:24 p.m.

6. CASE:

PLN-REZ-20020001

REQUEST: * **

Rezoning from General Industrial (I) to Northwest Regional Activity Center - Mixed-Use East (NWRAC-MUe)

PROPERTY

OWNER/APPLICANT:

Sunshine Shipyard, LLC.

AGENT:

Debbie Orshefsky, Holland & Knight

GENERAL LOCATION:

501 NW 6th Street

ABBREVIATED LEGAL

DESCRIPTION:

Lots 2 through 18, Block 25, Lots 31 through 48, Block 325, and Lots 18 and 31, Block 324 and that portion of right-ofway lying adjacent to said lots, Progresso, according to the

plat thereof, as recorded in plat Book 2, Page 18 of the public

records of Dade County, Florida,

COMMISSION DISTRICT:

ZONING DISTRICT:

2 - Steven Glassman I - General Industrial

PROPOSED ZONING:

Northwest Regional Activity Center - Mixed Use East

(NWRAC-MUe)

LAND USE:

Northwest Regional Activity Center

CASE PLANNER:

Nicholas Kalargyros

Disclosures were made at this time.

Debbie Orshefsky, representing the Applicant, stated that the subject property is located at 7th Street and Sistrunk Boulevard. She recalled that the original intent of the Northwest Regional Activity Center (RAC) zoning district was to bring mixed-use projects into a major arterial; however, a corridor to the south of the Northwest RAC is now being redeveloped from mostly Industrial uses into mixed use.

Ms. Orshefsky reviewed a rendering of uses in the subject and surrounding area, pointing out that rezoning of several parcels will set the stage for redevelopment. It will allow the original intent of rezoned corridors within the Northwest RAC to be realized.

Chair Maus requested clarification of the heights permitted by the General Industrial (I) and Northwest RAC zoning districts. Ms. Orshefsky advised that mixed-use development permits height of up to 65 ft. The Applicant may also choose to go before the City Commission to request up to 110 ft. in height. Ms. Parker added that a table of these differences is included in the Staff Report.

Ms. Orshefsky continued that rezoning the subject property to Northwest RAC would unify the zoning on Sistrunk Boulevard. This would allow for the assemblage and redevelopment of the entire block once all properties are under a zoning category that allows mixed use. The underlying land use is also Northwest RAC.

Mr. Shechtman requested clarification of what might be done to redevelop the parcel. Ms. Orshefsky replied that the Applicant does not yet have a plan; however, he hopes to enter into a joint venture with a mixed-use developer, and consistent zoning is necessary for this to succeed. The parcel in question is approximately 3 acres and will require master planning within the Northwest RAC guidelines. At present, old warehouses are located in the subject area.

Mr. Prewitt commented that he was supportive of this type of rezoning, and encouraged Staff to implement these changes in a more comprehensive manner where possible, as rezoning the site parcel by parcel is less effective. Chair Maus and Vice Chair Fertig agreed with this recommendation.

Ms. Orshefsky continued that the Applicant's team had invited the leadership of the Dorsey Riverbend Civic Association to a public meeting to discuss the project. They also presented the Item to the Progresso Village Civic Association, which provided an email of support.

Mr. Shechtman recalled that the Board had sent a communication to the City Commission requesting that they consider total rezoning of the area with boundaries at Sunrise Boulevard, Sistrunk Boulevard, Avenue of the Arts, and west of the FEC railway. Ms. Scott advised, however, that the Board had ultimately voted down this recommendation.

There being no further questions from the Board at this time, Chair Maus opened the public hearing. As there were no individuals wishing to speak on these Items, the Chair closed the public hearing and brought the discussion back to the Board.

Chair Maus asked if the City Commission has taken any action with regard to the communication discussed above. Ms. Parker replied that she did not recall the disposition of the communication, although Staff can report back on it at a later date. She noted that significant public engagement is required for comprehensive rezoning.

Motion made by Vice Chair Fertig, seconded by Mr. Weymouth, to include the Staff Report in the record. In a voice vote, the **motion** passed unanimously.

Motion made by Vice Chair Fertig, seconded by Mr. Prewitt, to approve [Case PLN-REZ-20020001]. In a roll call vote, the **motion** passed 8-0.

VI. COMMUNICATION TO THE CITY COMMISSION

None.

VII. FOR THE GOOD OF THE CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE

Vice Chair Fertig noted that the Downtown Master Plan is scheduled to go before the City Commission for approval in approximately two weeks. She suggested that Chair Maus attend this meeting to represent the Board's point of view and hear greater clarity on the Master Plan.

Chair Maus agreed to attend the City Commission meeting, advising that she did not know why Staff had sought extensive community input on the Downtown Master Plan but did

not act on the input provided. Vice Chair Fertig continued that the Board had heard input from several members of the community.

Motion made by Vice Chair Fertig, seconded by Mr. Prewitt, for Chair Maus to attend the City Commission meeting. In a voice vote, the **motion** passed unanimously.

Mr. Weymouth stated that in the future, when an Item generates significant public interest and many individuals wish to speak on that Item, it may be best to hear other Items out of order on the Agenda so their Applicants do not have to wait until what may be a very late hour to present their Applications.

There being no further business to come before the Board at this time, the meeting was adjourned at 10:45 p.m.

Any written public comments made 48 hours prior to the meeting regarding items discussed during the proceedings have been attached hereto.

Chair

Prototype

[Minutes prepared by K. McGuire, Prototype, Inc.]

FORM 8B MEMORANDUM OF VOTING CONFLICT FOR COUNTY, MUNICIPAL, AND OTHER LOCAL PUBLIC OFFICERS

LAST NAME—FIRST NAME—MIDDLE NAME SCOTT JACQUELYN E	NAME OF BOARD, COUNCIL, COMMISSION, AUTHORITY, OR COMMITTEE PLANNING + 2001NG-BOARD
MAILING ADDRESS 1626 SE 1 St 4	THE BOARD, COUNCIL, COMMISSION, AUTHORITY OR COMMITTEE ON WHICH I SERVE IS A UNIT OF: CITY DOUNTY DOTHER LOCAL AGENCY
Ft. LAUDERdale BrOWARD	NAME OF POLITICAL SUBDIVISION:
DATE ON WHICH VOTE OCCURRED 6-17-2020	MY POSITION IS: □ ELECTIVE APPOINTIVE

WHO MUST FILE FORM 8B

This form is for use by any person serving at the county, city, or other local level of government on an appointed or elected board, council, commission, authority, or committee. It applies to members of advisory and non-advisory bodies who are presented with a voting conflict of interest under Section 112.3143, Florida Statutes.

Your responsibilities under the law when faced with voting on a measure in which you have a conflict of interest will vary greatly depending on whether you hold an elective or appointive position. For this reason, please pay close attention to the instructions on this form before completing and filing the form.

INSTRUCTIONS FOR COMPLIANCE WITH SECTION 112.3143, FLORIDA STATUTES

A person holding elective or appointive county, municipal, or other local public office MUST ABSTAIN from voting on a measure which would inure to his or her special private gain or loss. Each elected or appointed local officer also MUST ABSTAIN from knowingly voting on a measure which would inure to the special gain or loss of a principal (other than a government agency) by whom he or she is retained (including the parent, subsidiary, or sibling organization of a principal by which he or she is retained); to the special private gain or loss of a relative; or to the special private gain or loss of a business associate. Commissioners of community redevelopment agencies (CRAs) under Sec. 163.356 or 163.357, F.S., and officers of independent special tax districts elected on a one-acre, one-vote basis are not prohibited from voting in that capacity.

For purposes of this law, a "relative" includes only the officer's father, mother, son, daughter, husband, wife, brother, sister, father-in-law, mother-in-law, son-in-law, and daughter-in-law. A "business associate" means any person or entity engaged in or carrying on a business enterprise with the officer as a partner, joint venturer, coowner of property, or corporate shareholder (where the shares of the corporation are not listed on any national or regional stock exchange).

ELECTED OFFICERS:

In addition to abstaining from voting in the situations described above, you must disclose the conflict:

PRIOR TO THE VOTE BEING TAKEN by publicly stating to the assembly the nature of your interest in the measure on which you are abstaining from voting; and

WITHIN 15 DAYS AFTER THE VOTE OCCURS by completing and filing this form with the person responsible for recording the minutes of the meeting, who should incorporate the form in the minutes.

APPOINTED OFFICERS:

Although you must abstain from voting in the situations described above, you are not prohibited by Section 112.3143 from otherwise participating in these matters. However, you must disclose the nature of the conflict before making any attempt to influence the decision, whether orally or in writing and whether made by you or at your direction.

IF YOU INTEND TO MAKE ANY ATTEMPT TO INFLUENCE THE DECISION PRIOR TO THE MEETING AT WHICH THE VOTE WILL BE TAKEN:

You must complete and file this form (before making any attempt to influence the decision) with the person responsible for recording the
minutes of the meeting, who will incorporate the form in the minutes. (Continued on page 2)

CE FORM 8B - EFF, 11/2013 Adopted by reference in Rule 34-7.010(1)(f), F.A.C. PAGE 1

APPOINTED OFFICERS (continued)

- A copy of the form must be provided immediately to the other members of the agency.
- The form must be read publicly at the next meeting after the form is filed.

IF YOU MAKE NO ATTEMPT TO INFLUENCE THE DECISION EXCEPT BY DISCUSSION AT THE MEETING:

- You must disclose orally the nature of your conflict in the measure before participating.
- You must complete the form and file it within 15 days after the vote occurs with the person responsible for recording the minutes of the
 meeting, who must incorporate the form in the minutes. A copy of the form must be provided immediately to the other members of the
 agency, and the form must be read publicly at the next meeting after the form is filed.

DISCLOSURE OF LOCAL OFFICER'S INTEREST
1, JACQVELYN Sco77 , hereby disclose that on JUNE 17 , 20 20:
(a) A measure came or will come before my agency which (check one or more) inured to my special private gain or loss;
inured to the special gain or loss of my business associate,;
inured to the special gain or loss of my relative,;
inured to the special gain or loss of, by
whom I am retained; or
inured to the special gain or loss of, which
is the parent subsidiary, or sibling organization or subsidiary of a principal which has retained me.
(b) The measure before my agency and the nature of my conflicting interest in the measure is as follows:
I am the Real Estate Brozer who sold the
property to the developer.
If disclosure of specific information would violate confidentiality or privilege pursuant to law or rules governing attorneys, a public officer, who is also an attorney, may comply with the disclosure requirements of this section by disclosing the nature of the interest in such a way as to provide the public with notice of the conflict.
6-11-2020
Date Filed Signature

NOTICE: UNDER PROVISIONS OF FLORIDA STATUTES §112.317, A FAILURE TO MAKE ANY REQUIRED DISCLOSURE CONSTITUTES GROUNDS FOR AND MAY BE PUNISHED BY ONE OR MORE OF THE FOLLOWING: IMPEACHMENT, REMOVAL OR SUSPENSION FROM OFFICE OR EMPLOYMENT, DEMOTION, REDUCTION IN SALARY, REPRIMAND, OR A CIVIL PENALTY NOT TO EXCEED \$10,000.

CE FORM 8B - EFF. 11/2013 Adopted by reference in Rule 34-7.010(1)(f), F.A.C. PAGE 2

PLANNING AND ZONING BOARD - JUNE 17, 2020 - PUBLIC COMMENT SPEAKER LIST

ITEM 1		eferral Request	PROJECT NAME: 3000 Alhambra	NOTES
Name		Phone Number	Email Addresss	
Cory and Susana Mcloug		5163307718	coryandsue@optonline.net	
Keith Poliakoff	Opposed	917-532-6492	keith.poliakoff@saul.com	
Keitii i Ollakoii	Оррозец	317-332-0432	KEITH. DONAKOH (@ Saul. COM	
ITEM 2	R19035	<u> </u>	PROJECT NAME: Homewood Suites	NOTES
Name		(Phone Number	Email Addresss	NOTES
Jeffrey Tolari	Opposed	248-890-6966		President of The Tides at Bridgeside Square (5 Minutes)
Eric Linder	Opposed	240-030-0300	EMLaw5@yahoo.com	President of Berkely South (5 Minutes)
Sherry Fitelson	Opposed	631-725-9218	sherry7@me.com	resident of berkely south (5 will des)
Dave Cowens	Opposed	513-535-7460	bcmb1836@aol.com	
Tim Donnelly	Opposed	313-333-7400	donnellit@aol.com	
Steve Ganon	Opposed		sganon@att.net	President Lauderdale Beach HOA (5 Minutes)
Robert Dhein	Opposed	754-213-9853	rldhein@gmail.com	Tresident Lauderdale Beach FIGA (5 Williates)
Gregory Noll	Opposed	734-213-3633	Gregnoll12@gmail.com	
Joseph Lerner	Opposed		jlerner62@gmail.com	Raised Hand
Carmela Palaino	Opposed	954-993-5004	carmela13@aol.com	Naiseu Hailu
Carolyn Korpi	Opposed	561-542-1277	ckorpi@akam.com	
ck	Opposed	954-630-1311	admin@tidesbridgeside.com	Raised Hand
David Kincade	Opposed	407-924-8240	dkincade@gmail.com	Raised Hand
Linda Dicicco	Opposed			Ivaiseu Mailu
Patricia Johnson	Opposed	9549183258 6317427574	Ldcphd@icloud.com pbj715@gmail.com	Raised Hand
	Opposed		jbinbi@hotmail.com	Raised Hand
Scott Israel		9783780044		Daised Hand
William Mcauley	Opposed Opposed	631-988-8906	Fdnygm328@aol.com	Raised Hand
Cherie Davis		3214383555	cheriefdavis@outlook.com	Raised Hand
KOIRE DRYSDALE	Opposed	310 739 1000	kbdrysdale@gmail.com	Daised Hand
Douglas Wheaton	Opposed	9545650696	dougwheatonpilot@yahoo.com	Raised Hand
Kendell Sherrer	Opposed	6142849058	KENDELL.SHERRER@CARDINALHEAL	
William Bradley	Opposed Opposed	6176203882	bbradley042@gmail.com	Raised Hand
jeffrey A cohen		9173014992	jeffcohen259@gmail.com	Raised Hand
Faye Budlongq	Opposed	6176205287	fbudlong@gmail.com	Raised Hand
Klaus Klein	Opposed	9176478346	klausrklein@hotmail.com	Daised Hand
William Frye	Opposed	4042175798	WRFRYEE@AOL.COM	Raised Hand
Ronald Whittle	Opposed	4042175798	rgwhittle@aol.com	Daised Hand
James Ginsburg	Opposed	9542605500	Jgins9092@aol.com	Raised Hand
Stacey ginsburg Arthur Edelstein	Opposed	954-600-7141	Jgins9092@aol.com	Daised Hand
	Opposed	2022078468	aedelstein8@gmail.com	Raised Hand
Brian May	Opposed	816-914-2819	fishermay@gmail.com	Raised Hand
Maureen OConnor	Opposed	2126203808	moconnor209@yahoo.com	Raised Hand
Ilene Haber	Opposed	6463217993	1	Raised Hand
John Rand	Opposed	207-838-2861	johntomrand@gmail.com	Raised Hand
Shawn Lagrega	Opposed	207-632-1886	shawnlagrega@gmail.com	Raised Hand
William McAuley	Opposed	6319888906	fdnygm328@aol.com	Raised Hand
David Risley	Opposed	6097039069	apdave830@yahoo.com	
Michael Salvatore	Opposed	609-273-3230	carver.327@hotmail.com	Delegal Hand
Sari Rosenshein	Opposed	9546677270	Tukuks@aol.com	Raised Hand
George McMurry	Opposed	7138286679	gmcmurry@gmail.com	Raised Hand
Monica Stojkovic	Opposed	201-739-1086	monicastojkovic@yahoo.com	Raised Hand
Troy Perrotta	Opposed	201-532-9792	pretzelman65@aol.com	Raised Hand
William Brown	Opposed	317.439.0628	cbaftlcom@gmail.com	Raised Hand
Laimute Paulauskaite	Opposed	9545529536	lp_consultingllc@yahoo.com	Paired Hand
Mark Schweizer	Opposed	954-557-3003	docmk2@aol.com	Raised Hand
Toni Ritornato	Opposed	9542323484	tonir@aol.com	Raised Hand
Robert Fitzgerald	Opposed	9542924435	bob@wtrwcorp.com	Raised Hand
Kerry Fitzgerald	Opposed	9548043484	kerryfitzzz13@gmail.com	Defeated the ed
Dag Hansson	Opposed	954-850-4350	dmh@consilliummarineus.com	Raised Hand
Laimute Paulauskaite	Opposed	9545529536	lp consultinglic@yahoo.com	Defeated Hand
Gregory Dawson	Opposed	954 804-5758	gad13@yahoo.com	Raised Hand
Edward Shlapak	Opposed	9547781899	edward.shlapak@gmail.com	
Karen Kentrell	Opposed	954-658-2012	karenkentrell@hotmail.com	

Dalament Halaff	0	047 630 3030	ultima a Constantition of the	Defendation d
Roberta Itzkoff	Opposed	917-620-2029	rlimo@optonline.net	Raised Hand
Lou Trombiero	Opposed	416-997-0220	trombiero@sympatico.ca	Raised Hand
Lucille Kyvallos	Opposed	631 725-9218	kyva30@me.com	
Michael Pellicone	Opposed	3025281698	mpell101@verizon.net	Raised Hand
Carol Jardine	Opposed	847-651-2966	<u>cdjardine@mac.com</u>	Raised Hand
Paul B Nix	Opposed	4042182869	paulbnix@gmail.com	Raised Hand
Stephanie Nizanty	Opposed	9546470012	s.nizanty8@gmail.com	
Robin D Schmidt	Opposed	954-235-9017	gotjenks45@live.com	
Robert Schmidt	Opposed	9543830732	robsdt1@live.com	Raised Hand
Ruzica Jevric	Opposed	4164310216	ruzicajevric@gmail.com	Raised Hand
Mark Schroer	Opposed	952-358-0881	mark1.schroer@gmail.com	Raised Hand
MARK HARITON	Opposed	954-565-1024	MLHARITON@AOL.COM	
Peter Lopez	Opposed	9544464845	Peter@shooterswaterfront.com	
Robert Curtiss	Opposed	954-257-5085	rccurt33@gmail.com	Raised Hand
Ellen Curtiss	Opposed	954-401-6341	ecurt20@aol.com	
Esther	Opposed	781-526-1919	seulgee@gmail.com	Raised Hand
Heidi El Tabakh	Opposed	8132053752	Heidi 3vl@hotmail.com	Raised Hand
Samar El Sallab	Opposed	8134824811	Samar.elsallab@outlook.com	Raised Hand
John Gerard Roth	Opposed	8596192783	johnrothmd@gmail.com	
Dario Badalamenti	Opposed	2013239329	badalamentiUSA@aol.com	Raised Hand
Nancy Stelnick	Opposed	9544515064	nstelnick1025@yahoo.com	Raised Hand
Regina Collins	Opposed	508 7372992	reginaannlee@yahoo.com	
Marinella Sica	Opposed	954-729-7023	maria@networkproservices.com	
David Gosselin	Opposed	438-830-6984	david.gosselin@outlook.com	Raised Hand
Tony Aubrey	Opposed	586-201-1682	tonyaubreysr@gmail.com	Naiseu Hariu
Tomasz G. Maslinski	Opposed	5704608146	tmaslinski@gmail.com	Raised Hand
Cory and Susana Mcloug		5163307718	coryandsue@optonline.net	Raiseu Hailu
			<u> </u>	
Stephen Sendelbeck	Opposed	5136166896	rssarch@aol.com	
James Santiago	Opposed	9544395425	jim@indclosing.com	
Christopher Bik	Opposed	9542904339	cbik@bellsouth.net	
Victoria Agudelo	Opposed	9544106344	agudelovictoria@bellsouth.net	Raised Hand
Ann Goldberg	Opposed	516 220-2977	anngoldberg74@gmail.com	
Mark Abbott	Opposed	9374707695	abbottcastro@aol.com	Raised Hand
Michael Moran	Opposed	3053893028	captmoran@msn.com	Raised Hand
Matthew Herman	Opposed	9547622555	MH@THLGLAW.COM	Raised Hand
Ulrike Parker	Opposed	754 777 2487	ullipark1@gmail.com	
Gregory Noll	Opposed	9544057528	Gregorynoll@comcast.net	
Eric Miller	Opposed	9543838170	eric@fortlauderdalegroup.com	Does not want to speak
Kevin Dinger	Opposed	2488602823	Kevinddinger@aol.com	Raised Hand
Bill Castro	Opposed	9374702178	elmeson@aol.com	
Thomas J. Tobin	Opposed	302-530-7821	ttobin1919@aol.com	
Greg Sampedro	Opposed	6094107417	greg.sampedro@gmail.com	Raised Hand
Stephen Li	Opposed	954-494-1617	stephen1617@yahoo.com	Raised Hand
Christina Pineiro	Opposed	727-687-3989	christinamp113@gmail.com	
Aida Lucaccioni	Opposed	8477037555	Aida@jasonsfoods.com	
Frank Bell	Оррозси			
I Talik Bell	Opposed	9042345678	fjbell2@gmail.com	
Anthony Schueth		9042345678 9739603484	fjbell2@gmail.com tonys@pocp.com	Raised Hand
	Opposed			Raised Hand
Anthony Schueth	Opposed Opposed	9739603484	tonys@pocp.com	Raised Hand Raised Hand
Anthony Schueth John Kizer	Opposed Opposed Opposed	9739603484 5704416634	tonys@pocp.com Jfkizer@gmail.com	
Anthony Schueth John Kizer Mark Haggard	Opposed Opposed Opposed Opposed	9739603484 5704416634 513-470-0589	tonys@pocp.com Jfkizer@gmail.com Mark7.haggard@gmail.com	
Anthony Schueth John Kizer Mark Haggard Maria Isaza	Opposed Opposed Opposed Opposed Opposed	9739603484 5704416634 513-470-0589 9546094318	tonys@pocp.com Jfkizer@gmail.com Mark7.haggard@gmail.com isazamaria@gmail.com	Raised Hand
Anthony Schueth John Kizer Mark Haggard Maria Isaza Daniel Brown	Opposed Opposed Opposed Opposed Opposed Opposed Opposed	9739603484 5704416634 513-470-0589 9546094318 5134766622	tonys@pocp.com Jfkizer@gmail.com Mark7.haggard@gmail.com isazamaria@gmail.com dtbrowndds@gmail.com	Raised Hand
Anthony Schueth John Kizer Mark Haggard Maria Isaza Daniel Brown Thomas Nolan	Opposed Opposed Opposed Opposed Opposed Opposed Opposed Opposed Opposed	9739603484 5704416634 513-470-0589 9546094318 5134766622 917-330-1480	tonys@pocp.com Jfkizer@gmail.com Mark7.haggard@gmail.com Isazamaria@gmail.com dtbrowndds@gmail.com thomas-nolan@att.net thomas-nolan@att.net	Raised Hand Raised Hand
Anthony Schueth John Kizer Mark Haggard Maria Isaza Daniel Brown Thomas Nolan Ana Marie Nolan Val Lukshides	Opposed	9739603484 5704416634 513-470-0589 9546094318 5134766622 917-330-1480 917-330-1480 5613769095	tonys@pocp.com Jfkizer@gmail.com Mark7.haggard@gmail.com isazamaria@gmail.com dtbrowndds@gmail.com thomas-nolan@att.net thomas-nolan@att.net echoper01@gmail.com	Raised Hand Raised Hand
Anthony Schueth John Kizer Mark Haggard Maria Isaza Daniel Brown Thomas Nolan Ana Marie Nolan Val Lukshides Peter Gallagher	Opposed	9739603484 5704416634 513-470-0589 9546094318 5134766622 917-330-1480 917-330-1480 5613769095 617 894 1603	tonys@pocp.com Jfkizer@gmail.com Mark7.haggard@gmail.com isazamaria@gmail.com dtbrowndds@gmail.com thomas-nolan@att.net thomas-nolan@att.net echoper01@gmail.com pete269@verizon.net	Raised Hand Raised Hand Raised Hand
Anthony Schueth John Kizer Mark Haggard Maria Isaza Daniel Brown Thomas Nolan Ana Marie Nolan Val Lukshides Peter Gallagher Page Bradley	Opposed	9739603484 5704416634 513-470-0589 9546094318 5134766622 917-330-1480 917-330-1480 5613769095 617 894 1603 9546496669	tonys@pocp.com Jfkizer@gmail.com Mark7.haggard@gmail.com isazamaria@gmail.com dtbrowndds@gmail.com thomas-nolan@att.net thomas-nolan@att.net echoper01@gmail.com pete269@verizon.net pagebradleyvino@gmail.com	Raised Hand Raised Hand
Anthony Schueth John Kizer Mark Haggard Maria Isaza Daniel Brown Thomas Nolan Ana Marie Nolan Val Lukshides Peter Gallagher Page Bradley Susan Meyer	Opposed	9739603484 5704416634 513-470-0589 9546094318 5134766622 917-330-1480 917-330-1480 5613769095 617 894 1603 9546496669 954-261-1579	tonys@pocp.com Jfkizer@gmail.com Mark7.haggard@gmail.com isazamaria@gmail.com dtbrowndds@gmail.com thomas-nolan@att.net thomas-nolan@att.net echoper01@gmail.com pete269@verizon.net pagebradleyvino@gmail.com mslm424@aol.com	Raised Hand Raised Hand Raised Hand
Anthony Schueth John Kizer Mark Haggard Maria Isaza Daniel Brown Thomas Nolan Ana Marie Nolan Val Lukshides Peter Gallagher Page Bradley Susan Meyer Violetta Sica	Opposed	9739603484 5704416634 513-470-0589 9546094318 5134766622 917-330-1480 917-330-1480 5613769095 617 894 1603 9546496669 954-261-1579 9545612539	tonys@pocp.com Jfkizer@gmail.com Mark7.haggard@gmail.com isazamaria@gmail.com dtbrowndds@gmail.com thomas-nolan@att.net thomas-nolan@att.net echoper01@gmail.com pete269@verizon.net pagebradleyvino@gmail.com msIm424@aol.com maria@networkproservices.com	Raised Hand Raised Hand Raised Hand
Anthony Schueth John Kizer Mark Haggard Maria Isaza Daniel Brown Thomas Nolan Ana Marie Nolan Val Lukshides Peter Gallagher Page Bradley Susan Meyer Violetta Sica Luise Lotz	Opposed	9739603484 5704416634 513-470-0589 9546094318 5134766622 917-330-1480 917-330-1480 5613769095 617 894 1603 9546496669 954-261-1579 9545612539 9177541193	tonys@pocp.com Jfkizer@gmail.com Mark7.haggard@gmail.com isazamaria@gmail.com dtbrowndds@gmail.com thomas-nolan@att.net thomas-nolan@att.net echoper01@gmail.com pete269@verizon.net pagebradleyvino@gmail.com mslm424@aol.com maria@networkproservices.com liblo7@aol.com	Raised Hand Raised Hand Raised Hand
Anthony Schueth John Kizer Mark Haggard Maria Isaza Daniel Brown Thomas Nolan Ana Marie Nolan Val Lukshides Peter Gallagher Page Bradley Susan Meyer Violetta Sica Luise Lotz Craig Gilmour	Opposed	9739603484 5704416634 513-470-0589 9546094318 5134766622 917-330-1480 917-330-1480 5613769095 617 894 1603 9546496669 954-261-1579 9545612539 9177541193 647-504-0122	tonys@pocp.com Jfkizer@gmail.com Mark7.haggard@gmail.com isazamaria@gmail.com dtbrowndds@gmail.com thomas-nolan@att.net thomas-nolan@att.net echoper01@gmail.com pete269@verizon.net pagebradleyvino@gmail.com mslm424@aol.com maria@networkproservices.com liblo7@aol.com cgilmour_ca@yahoo.com	Raised Hand Raised Hand Raised Hand Raised Hand
Anthony Schueth John Kizer Mark Haggard Maria Isaza Daniel Brown Thomas Nolan Ana Marie Nolan Val Lukshides Peter Gallagher Page Bradley Susan Meyer Violetta Sica Luise Lotz	Opposed	9739603484 5704416634 513-470-0589 9546094318 5134766622 917-330-1480 917-330-1480 5613769095 617 894 1603 9546496669 954-261-1579 9545612539 9177541193	tonys@pocp.com Jfkizer@gmail.com Mark7.haggard@gmail.com isazamaria@gmail.com dtbrowndds@gmail.com thomas-nolan@att.net thomas-nolan@att.net echoper01@gmail.com pete269@verizon.net pagebradleyvino@gmail.com mslm424@aol.com maria@networkproservices.com liblo7@aol.com	Raised Hand Raised Hand Raised Hand

	T_	1	T	
Arthur Edelstein	Opposed	2022078468	art@edelsteinus.com	Raised Hand
Kristin Coletti	Opposed	4016415625	kc-realestate@hotmail.com	
Carol Goulding	Supports	954 566 3855	Robertpcarol@bellsouth.net	
Maureen Stoyka	Opposed	954-850-4350	maureenmreal@aol.com	Raised Hand
Chris chapman	Opposed	8472249785	Cdchapman8892@gmail.com	
alberto giraldo	Opposed	9172047990	agiraldo06@aim.com	
Alice Blaine-Jaffe	Opposed	9783024190	armbears@hotmail.com	
Melissa Corominas	Opposed	9548223446	Jackiet2709@aol.com	
Luise Lotz	Opposed	9177541193	liblo7@aol.com	
Christina Lesco	Opposed	9179138276	tinalesco@yahoo.com	
Larry Fishman	Opposed	6463274819	golfing82@yahoo.com	
Steven Dworkin	Opposed	561 445-1147	maxandlill@aol.com	
John Thompson	Opposed	7735045646	chiflaco@aol.com	Raised Hand
William Stoneberg	Opposed	9547017512	wrstoneberg@me.com	
Michele Dignum	Opposed	617-504-3672	micheledignum@gmail.com	Raised Hand
Alfredo Vallenilla	Opposed	9545947549	alfvalfer@gmail.com	
Pat Tarsey	Opposed	954-306-3444	ladylaw@mindspring.com	
Fabricio Guimaraes	Opposed	9544949880	guimaraesff@hotmail.com	
Robert Gibeling	Opposed	404-266-9615	bobgibeling@gmail.com	
Joann Edwards	Opposed	954-566-3901	iedwardsbroker@gmail.com	
Lori Chowanec	Opposed	7322413570	loridahl@comcast.net	
Gena Rezmer	Opposed	407-844-7244	genarez13@yahoo.com	Raised Hand
Erez Pashut	Opposed	11447577792662	perezauckland@hotmail.com	
Richard Buckheit	Opposed	917-327-7690	crickrun@hotmail.com	
Heidi El Tabakh	Opposed	8132053752	Eltabakh.heidi@gmail.com	Raised Hand
Richard Schuster	Opposed	9545610074	rschuster994@gmail.com	Raised Hand
Adriana Sviedrys	Opposed	516-361-2958	adrianasviedrys@yahoo.com	Raised Hand
Carol Sossi	Opposed	954-557-7959	CAROLSOSSI@ATT.NET	Raised Hand
JILL ALSTON	Opposed	9498873789	JILLIAN_ALSTON@YAHOO.COM	Raised Hand
Sharon Wong	Opposed	9546468100	sharonnym@hotmail.com	Raised Hand
Carole Camacho	Opposed	239-219-7404	Carolecamacho321@gmail.com	Raiseu Hallu
Rocco DiBruno	Opposed	954-307-8735	Northbeach3011@gmail.com	
Al Amaro		646 2067479		Raised Hand
Mary Jackson	Opposed	9548156852	al amaro@yahoo.com Miawi@aol.com	Raiseu naliu
Braden J Falasca	Opposed Opposed	9544456983	bradfalasca@gmail.com	
Emil & Elin	Opposed	754-249-5711	emil@partnerloggroup.com	
Valkiria Lukshides	Opposed	5613769095	echoper01@gmail.com	
CAROL SOSSI	Opposed	954-557-7959	CAROLSOSSI@ATT.NET	Deised Head
Al Amaro	Opposed	6462067479	al amaro@yahoo.com	Raised Hand
Melba Olmeda	Opposed	9178346262	melba amaro@yahoo.com	
Rose Michel		5164484011	searose21@aol.com	
Greg Dawson	Opposed	9549935004	gad13@yahoo.com	Raised Hand
Luise Lotz	Opposed	9177541193	liblo7@aol.com	Deise d Use d
Doria Yeaman	Opposed	9544949825	dyearic@aol.com	Raised Hand
Cynthia Spaeth	Opposed	8288086974	cyndyjennifer@hotmail.com	Raised Hand
carol jardine	Opposed	8476512966	cdjardine@mac.com	Raised Hand
Mary Dhein	Opposed	954 463-4559	M-dhein@yahoo.com	Raised Hand
Eve Bazer	Opposed	0	In the contract of the contrac	
Marcy callahan	Opposed	9542408525	Macal18@aol.com	
David Graves	Opposed	7634588334	Dwgprof@aol.com	
David Graves	Opposed	9548123009	caseypcallahan@icloud.com	
ITEM 3	PL19002		PROJECT NAME: Gummakonda Plat	NOTES
Name		Phone Number	Email Addresss	
Jeffrey Tolari	Opposed	248-890-6966	manager@tidesbridgeside.com	President of The Tides at Bridgeside Square (5 Minutes)
Carmela Palaino	Opposed	954-993-5004	carmela13@aol.com	
Susan Meyer	Opposed	954-261-1579	mslm424@aol.com	
Greg Dawson	Opposed	9549935004	gad13@yahoo.com	
ITEM 4	R19046		PROJECT NAME: Davie 1	NOTES
Name	In Favor or	Phone Number	Email Addresss	
Richard Schuster	Opposed	954-336-4081	rschuster994@gmail.com	

ITEM 5	PDD19002		PROJECT NAME: Towers Place at Las NOTES	
Name	In Favor or	Phone Number	Email Addresss	
MARK NELSON	Supports	9544445107	TOWERSRH@COMCAST.NET	Speaking on applicant's behalf (Eyal Livnet)
Rabbi Chaim Slavaticki	Supports	9542254412	Chaimslava@gmail.com	
Karla J Thatcher	Supports	7543014466	KThatch0709@yahoo.com	
David Abers	Supports	9547983744	dabers@nadg.com	Speaking on applicant's behalf (Robert Lochrie)
Dominic Annecca	Supports	9548819884	dannecca@gmail.com	
Jean-Pierre Brehier	Opposed	954-563-2050	jp@rezclick.com	
Lynne winters	Opposed	954/673-0264	lewinters@aol.com	
Peter Dewick	Supports	9547924023	pda@land-planning.org	
Zuhair Jalloul	Supports	561-702-4216	zj@flcengineers.com	Speaking on applicant's behalf (Eyal Livnet)
Al Livnat	Supports	7702946543	Al@crownhgroup.com	Speaking on applicant's behalf (Robert Lochrie)
Rick yazback	Neutral	9544012874	Ryazback@comcast.net	
ITEM 6	PLN-REZ-20020001		PROJECT NAME: Rezoning of 503	1 NV NOTES
Name	In Favor or (Phone Number		Email Addresss	