APPROVED

AUDIT ADVISORY BOARD MEETING CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE 1 E. Broward Boulevard Suite 444 4th Floor Finance Conference Room Thursday, February 1, 2024, 5:00 PM

| | | | e Attendance – 9/30/24 |
|---|-------------------|----------------|---------------------------|
| Board Member | <u>Attendance</u> | <u>Present</u> | <u>Absent</u> |
| Joey Epstein | Р | 2 | 0 |
| Eric Soh | А | 1 | 1 |
| David Brown | Р | 2 | 0 |
| *Stephen Emery | Р | 1 | 0 |
| *Torm started after 1 st meeting | | | |

*Term started after 1st meeting

Staff Present

Linda Short, Director, Finance Aaron Kendrick, Deputy Director, Finance Laura Garcia, Controller, Finance Marco Hausy, Auditor Richard Morris, Senior Management Analyst, OMB Debra Conyers, Board Liaison

Other Attendees

Brett Friedman, RSM US, LLP

Call to Order

Chairman Joey Epstein called the meeting to order at 5:08 PM.

Roll Call

At the time of roll call, three appointed members to the Board were present, allowing for a quorum.

Unfinished Business

David Brown made a motion to move the Audit Advisory Board meeting to Thursday, February 1, 2024. Stephen Emery seconded the motion. All in favor of rescheduling the meeting was approved unanimously in a voice vote.

Floor Open for Public Input

Chairman Epstein opened the floor for public input. No members of the public came forward.

Quarterly Audit Compliance Report- December 2023

Audit status report for the month of December 2023 was presented.

The Board requested three City Departments be at the next regularly scheduled meeting: Development Services (DSD), Information Technology (ITS) and Executive Airport (FXE).

Board Member Mr. Brown requested further reporting on Findings 502- City Departments Not Reviewing Monthly Cellphone Invoices (ITS) and Findings 478- Lack of Billing Interest Payments and Penalties for Late Payments and 488- Independent Verification Control of Lease Rent Collection (FXE).

In addition, Mr. Brown requested DSD to discuss processes on collecting code liens and any updates on the Amnesty Program.

Further discussion ensued between Board Members and City Staff.

Audit Work Plan Update

Ms. Short discussed that the first and second phase of the ERP system was implemented. She explained the audit is not ready and is requesting to delay it until April 1st, 2024. There is a deadline to issue the audit in mid-June.

Action to appoint a representative to the Revenue Estimating Conference

Chairman Epstein stated this will be discussed and decided on during the February 28th, 2024, Special Meeting.

Special Meeting CRA Audit Report- Motion

Chairman Epstein asked for a motion for special meeting on February 28, 2024, at 4:00 PM. David Brown made the motion and Stephen Emery seconded. The special meeting was approved unanimously in a voice vote.

Other Business

N/A

Communication to the City Commission

N/A

<u>Adjournment</u>

The next regularly scheduled Audit Advisory Board meeting will be April 25th, 2024, at 5:00 PM.

The meeting adjourned at 5:55 PM [Minutes prepared by Debra Conyers, Board Liaison]



CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE

Open Audit Findings Status Report

External Audit, Single Audit, and City Commission Audit

As of December 31, 2023

OPEN AUDIT FINDINGS STATUS REPORT

The Office of Management and Budget compiles the quarterly Open Audit Findings Status Report based upon updates provided by departmental staff. Each report provides the status of open audit findings from external auditors and the City Auditor's Office. The report is distributed to the City Manager, City's Executive Strategy Team, and Audit Advisory Board on a quarterly basis.

There are currently 22 open audit findings, including observations. As departments implement the corrective action plans and upload supporting documentation into the Audit Compliance Tracking System (ACTS), they are required to notify the City Auditor that a finding has been resolved. The City Auditor's Office will continuously review these responses throughout the year and notify the System Administrator in the Office of Management and Budget to close findings that have been resolved.

The departmental breakdown of open findings can be found in the table below.

| DEPARTMENT | December 2019 | December 2020 | December 2021 | December 2022 | March 2023 | June 2023 | September 2023 | December 2023 |
|---------------------------------|------------------|------------------|------------------|------------------|---------------|--------------|-------------------|------------------|
| City Manager's Office | 1 | 0 | 2 | 10 | 10 | 6 | 8 | 8 |
| Community Redevelopment Agency | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Development Services | 2 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Finance | 8 | 4 | 3 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 7 | 7 |
| Human Resources | 4 | 3 | 3 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Information Technology Services | 0 | 1 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 7 | 7 |
| Parks and Recreation | 1 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Public Works | 0 | 0 | 3 | 3 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| TOTAL | 16 | 10 | 15 | 20 | 17 | 13 | 22 | 22 |

Status of Audit Findings as of December 31, 2023

| Issue No | External Auditor's Findings | Status | Page | | | | | |
|----------|---|--------------------------|------|--|--|--|--|--|
| Finance | Department | | | | | | | |
| 466 | Finding 1 - Change Order Approvals, Rio Vista Restoration Project | Implemented | 5 | | | | | |
| 467 | Finding 2 - Continuing Contracts, Rio Vista Restoration Project | Implemented | 6 | | | | | |
| | Single Audit Findings | | | | | | | |
| Finance | Department | | | | | | | |
| 479 | Finding 2021-001 - Schedule of Expenditures of Federal Awards and State Financial Assistance | Partially Implemented | 9 | | | | | |
| 499 | 2022-002 Eligibility - 14.241 HOPWA | Implemented | 10 | | | | | |
| City Ma | nager's Office | | | | | | | |
| 498 | 2022-001 - Reporting - 20.106 Airport Improvements | Implemented | 12 | | | | | |
| | City Auditor's Office Findings | | | | | | | |
| Finance | Department | | | | | | | |
| 429 | Finding #12: Duplicate P-Card Detection | Implemented | 15 | | | | | |
| 504 | Finding 1 - Some Employees Receiving Both a Cell Phone Allowance and City-Issued Cell Phone | Implemented | 16 | | | | | |
| 506 | Finding 3 - Physical Inventory for City Vehicles | Not Implemented | 17 | | | | | |
| City Ma | nager's Office | | | | | | | |
| 476 | Finding 1 - Documentation for Lease Obligations | Implemented | 20 | | | | | |
| 477 | Finding 2 - Adequate Policies and Procedures for Lease Operations | Partially Implemented | 21 | | | | | |
| 478 | Finding 3 - Lack of Billing Interest Payments and Penalties for Late Rent Payments | Partially Implemented | 22 | | | | | |
| 481 | Finding 4 - Security and Construction Deposits | Partially Implemented | 23 | | | | | |
| 485 | Finding 7 - File Retention Practices | Implemented | 24 | | | | | |
| 488 | Observation 3 - Independent Verification Control of Lease Rent Collection | Partially Implemented | 25 | | | | | |
| 505 | Finding 2 - Internal Control Process and PSM for City Take-Home Vehicles | Partially Implemented | 26 | | | | | |
| Informa | tion Technology Services Department | | | | | | | |
| 464 | Computer Software and Programs Master Inventory Listing | Implemented | 28 | | | | | |
| 465 | Weak Internal Controls Relating to Software Programs used by Various Departments | Partially Implemented | 29 | | | | | |
| 500 | Finding 1 - Lack of confirmation that ordered IT service/equipment had been received/working | Partially Implemented | 30 | | | | | |
| 501 | Observation 1 - Outdated PSM 9.3.2 Does Not Reflect Current Computer Environment and Practices | Partially Implemented | 31 | | | | | |
| 502 | Observation 2 - City Departments Not Reviewing Monthly Cellphone Invoices | Not Implemented | 32 | | | | | |
| 503 | Observation 3 - IT Equipment/Service Ordering Spreadsheet Does Not Account for Age of Order Tickets | Partially Implemented | 33 | | | | | |
| 507 | Observation 1 - ITS Control Process for Issuing City Cell Phones and Removing Cell Phone Allowance | Partially Implemented | 34 | | | | | |

EXTERNAL AUDITOR'S FINDINGS



Finance Department



Finding 1 - Change Order Approvals, Rio Vista Restoration Project

| Појсск | | | | |
|------------------------------|--|---|---|--|
| Issue No: | 466 | | | |
| Date of Finding: | 11/22/2021 | | | |
| Final Date of Completion | 03/31/2024 | Name | I Title I | Department |
| Responsible Person 1 | lshort | Linda Short | Director | Finance |
| Responsible Person 2 | jboutilier | Jason Boutilier | Senior Management Analyst | Finance |
| Correction Plan Status: | Implemented | | Finding Type: Finding | |
| Next Milestone | | | | |
| Milestone Date of Completion | | | | |
| Department: | Finance | | | |
| Audit Initiator | 3rd Party Auditor | | | |
| <u>Title:</u> | Finding 1 - Change C | order Approvals, Rio V | vista Restoration Project | |
| Issue / Observation | | | egarding the City's interpretation conders and task orders. | of its procurement policies |
| Recommendation: | • | • | t policies and procedures for clarity garding change orders and task order | |
| Correction Plan: | and Manual will the expenditures in task | be reviewed to place orders and chang | concurs with the recommendation rovide specificity and consistency e orders. Additional training will be ering contracts in using Departments. | with regard to eligible provided to Procurement |
| Current Status: | created a joint profes contract managemen | sional development p t processes. Training | rvices Division and the Public Works I program with the goal of enhancing the dates and course topics are included ent is awaiting final review from the Cit | procurement and in the attached |

Finding 2 - Continuing Contracts, Rio Vista Restoration Project

| Issue No: | 467 | | | | | |
|------------------------------|--|---|--|--|--|--|
| Date of Finding: | 11/22/2021 | | | | | |
| Final Date of Completion | 03/31/2024 | Norma | T:41- | Devertment | | |
| Responsible Person 1 | lshort | Name Linda Short | Title Director | Department Finance | | |
| Responsible Person 2 | jboutilier | Jason Boutilier | Senior Management Analyst | Finance | | |
| Correction Plan Status: | Implemented | | I Finding Type: Finding | | | |
| Next Milestone | | | | | | |
| Milestone Date of Completion | | | | | | |
| Department: | Finance | | | | | |
| Audit Initiator | 3rd Party Auditor | | | | | |
| <u>Title:</u> | Finding 2 - Contin | uing Contracts, Rio Vista | a Restoration Project | | | |
| Issue / Observation | its continuing co | The City appears to have taken conflicting interpretations regarding the administrative renewals of its continuing contracts and whether the administrative renewal provides for additional funding without City Commission approval. | | | | |
| Recommendation: | regarding admini | - | t policies and procedures as well a vals. The City should provide the pretation. | - | | |
| Correction Plan: | and Manual will of administrative charged with ad on proper use | Management Response: Management concurs with the recommendation. The Procurement Code and Manual will be reviewed to provide specificity and consistency with regard to the dollar value of administrative renewals. Additional training will be provided to Procurement staff as well as staff charged with administering contracts in using Departments. Public Works will coordinate training on proper use of Continuing Contracts with the Procurement division to ensure all Project Management staff understand the related procurement policies. | | | | |
| <u>Current Status:</u> | conjunction with th Competitive Procu Management" for requirements for c topics such as pro discussed. Beginn | ne Public Works Departm irement Requirements for the procurement staff an construction and professi jects, purchase orders, th ing in January 2022, sp ntract renewals. The Fin | Department/Procurement Services Div nent, conducted training entitled "City of or Construction, Professional Services d project managers regarding competi onal services and project management ask orders, funding, invoicing, and con ecificity has been added to Commissio ance Department is awaiting final revie | of Fort Lauderdale and Project tive bidding t overview. Several ntracting were n Agenda Memos | | |

SINGLE AUDIT FINDINGS



Finance Department



Finding 2021-001 - Schedule of Expenditures of Federal Awards and State Financial Assistance

| Issue No: | 479 | | | |
|------------------------------|--|---|---|--|
| Date of Finding: | 07/05/2022 | | | |
| Final Date of Completion | 07/31/2024 | Name | Title | Department |
| Responsible Person 1 | lshort | Linda Short | Director | Finance |
| Responsible Person 2 | Implemented | | | |
| Correction Plan Status: | Implemented | Finding Type: | Material Weakness | |
| Next Milestone | Submit copies of the gir Financial Assistance | | the chedule of Expenditures of Fe | ederal Awards and State |
| Milestone Date of Completion | 07/31/2024 | | | |
| Department: | Finance | | | |
| Audit Initiator | Single Audit | | | |
| <u>Title:</u> | Finding 2021-001 - Scl | nedule of Expenditur | es of Federal Awards and State Final | ncial Assistance |
| Issue / Observation | Internal control should be in place to ensure the Schedule of Expenditures of Federal Awards and State Financial Assistance (SEFA) is prepared correctly including identification of the proper Assistance Listing Number (ALN) and inclusion of grant expenditures that should be reported on the SEFA. | | | |
| | The City inappropriately listed a grant under the incorrect ALN. In addition, the City reported gran expenditures on the SEFA that should not have been reported on the SEFA. Finally the Cit reported expenditures as state financial assistance that should have been reported as Federa financial assistance. | | | |
| Recommendation: | The City should imple with appropriate standa | | rnal controls to ensure the SEFA | is prepared in accordance |
| Correction Plan: | Staff preparing the Si and approval. | EFA will submit cop | ies of the grant agreements along | with the SEFA for review |
| <u>Current Status:</u> | Number 21.019 for pro original schedule. The State for CFSA prograu department is reviewin ensure that the SEFA i | gram COVID Relief, City also adjusted th m 55.004, as it was i g the current interna s prepared properly. | clude approximately \$16.1M for Assis American Rescue Program, which w e SEFA for approximately \$49,000 fr mproperly classified in the original ve I controls to ensure that they are prop This finding will remain open until the Report (ACFR), with a result that the | as omitted from om Federal to rsion. The Finance perly designed to e submission of the |

2022-002 Eligibility - 14.241 HOPWA

| U | J | | | |
|------------------------------|--|---|---|--|
| Issue No: | 499 | | | |
| Date of Finding: | 07/21/2023 | | | |
| Final Date of Completion | 07/31/2024 | Name | I Title | Department |
| Responsible Person 1 | lshort | Linda Short | Director | Finance |
| Responsible Person 2 | rwilliams | Rachel Williams | HCD Manager | City Manager |
| Correction Plan Status: | Implemented | | ı <u>Finding Type:</u> Finding | I |
| Next Milestone | | | | |
| Milestone Date of Completion | | | | |
| Department: | Finance | | | |
| Audit Initiator | Single Audit | | | |
| <u>Title:</u> | 2022-002 Eligibility - | 14.241 HOPWA | | |
| Issue / Observation | documented in the inconsistent with n monthly support p | Provide Enterprise nonthly income am provided was not | e used in determining eligibility fo e (PE) System. In addition, inco ount noted and there was evider for a consecutive 3-month perio ion was used to verify income af | ome verification support was nee of instances where the od, as required for income |
| | City for review a (sub-recipient) input reviewed during th | and approval of it an intake form e annual monitorin ation information | r inputted by the agency (sub-rec funding for housing. For case which includes income, proof of g process completed by the City. entered and scans of supportin | management, the agency status and identification is The participant file should |
| Recommendation: | To increase the sample population and frequency of testing of the participant case files to ensure that the program guidelines are being met. Increase the frequency of the subrecipient monitoring and perform follow-up of noted monitoring findings within prior to traditional annual monitoring. In addition, to provide continual training to the subrecipients and perform assessment of efficiencies of procedures to determine viability of relationship. | | | |
| Correction Plan: | monitoring letter w | | ng performance of the subrecip the noted findings to the ag rledge the finding. | - |
| | - | to attend, and edu | ning on January 12, 2023, whicl ucated on the proper way to perfo | - |
| <u>Current Status:</u> | increased subrecipie and September 202 This finding will rema | ent monitoring. Additi 3 and the City did no | ent Division provided training to subre onally, HUD conducted monitoring of t receive any findings or concerns rel results of the next Single Audit, (exp is been resolved. | f this grant in August ated to this program. |

City Manager's Office



2022-001 - Reporting - 20.106 Airport Improvements

| | <u> </u> | • | • | |
|------------------------------|---|----------------------|--|--------------------------|
| Issue No: | 498 | | | |
| Date of Finding: | 07/21/2023 | | | |
| Final Date of Completion | 07/31/2024 | Name | I Title I | Department |
| Responsible Person 1 | rjames | Rufus James | Director | City Manager |
| Responsible Person 2 | charrison | Carlton Harrison | Assistant Director | City Manager |
| Correction Plan Status: | Implemented | | Finding Type: Finding | |
| Next Milestone | | | | |
| Milestone Date of Completion | | | | |
| Department: | City Manager | | | |
| Audit Initiator | Single Audit | | | |
| <u>Title:</u> | 2022-001 - Reporting | - 20.106 Airport Imp | rovements | |
| Issue / Observation | The City could not and submitted annual | • | ation that SF-425, Federal Financ npliance Supplement. | ial Report was completed |
| | The City is required to perform task in noted areas to be in compliance with the grant terms. For this program annual reporting was a compliance requirement, through submission of the SF-425, Federal Financial Report. The Airport was unaware that this compliance requirement was to be fulfilled by them, therefore, the report was not filed deeming them not in compliance. | | | |
| Recommendation: | Ŭ | 0 | terms with the grant manager/pro m is responsible to complete the task | |
| Correction Plan: | The airport submits quarterly reports for FAA AIP projects, however due to an oversight the annual SF-425 form was not completed. The SF-245 form was completed and submitted on June 14, 2023, and a procedure has been drafted to ensure compliance with the reporting requirements in the future. Additionally, the Airports Project Manager position will be moved from the Public Works Department to the Executive Airport Department in fiscal year 2024 which will improve supervision of the grant reporting requirements. | | | |
| Current Status: | | | AA, the Airport Engineer position beer 2023, and a new procedure has been | |

CITY AUDITOR'S OFFICE FINDINGS



Finance Department



Finding #12: Duplicate P-Card Detection

| Issue No: | 429 | | | | |
|------------------------------|---|--|--|--|--|
| Date of Finding: | 03/01/2019 | | | | |
| Final Date of Completion | 03/31/2024 | Name | I Title | Department | |
| Responsible Person 1 | Igarcia | Laura Garcia | Controller | Finance | |
| Responsible Person 2 | lshort | Linda Short | Director | Finance | |
| Correction Plan Status: | Implemented | | i <u>Finding Type:</u> Material Weakness | 5 | |
| Next Milestone | Work with City Aud | itor's Office to close o | ut finding. | | |
| Milestone Date of Completion | 03/31/2024 | | | | |
| Department: | Finance | | | | |
| Audit Initiator | Commission Audit | | | | |
| <u>Title:</u> | Finding #12: Duplic | cate P-Card Detection | 1 | | |
| Issue / Observation | | • | does not prevent or detect dupl yable and the respective departments. | | |
| | Cause: Finance lacked transactions. | software that would | d enable and facilitate a control | over a high volume of | |
| | Impact: Material waste cou | ld occur as uncorrecte | ed duplicate payments of the same tran | saction. | |
| Recommendation: | Finance should e invoices. | enhance internal co | ntrols to prevent and detect dupl | icate payments of P-card | |
| Correction Plan: | 2023, P-Card cha (AP) for processi | With the implementation of the new Enterprise Resource Planning (ERP) system in fiscal year 2023, P-Card charges will be approved by the Department and routed through Accounts Payable (AP) for processing. Part of this process will include uploading the P-card charges directly to the P-card module of the ERP system on a daily basis, which will help identify duplicate invoices. | | | |
| Current Status: | system on a daily b the City's old finance \$450 and \$550 hitt charge in FAMIS. It processed in a con- it is the sole system require a receipt, s without the departer responsibilities in It "Requester" can at must be done by se In conclusion, althor payments much ea approval. The departer | basis. Prior to Infor imp cial system, FAMIS. F ing the same index co f the \$450 p-card chan npletely different system n used to process all f omeone could not atta nent catching the dup nfor based on security tach a receipt to a PO pomeone with the "App bugh it is still a manual usier due to consolidat | 3, 2022, and P-card charges are being plementation, p-card transaction detail for example, if you had two separate p- ode and sub-object, you would only see rge was also paid via PO, which also w em (BuySpeed), it would be difficult to in financial transactions for the City. Since ach the same receipt to a p-card transa- licate entry. Furthermore, because ther r roles, there are multiple levels of chect 0 in the system, but they cannot close o prover" role, and you cannot have both al process, Infor makes the identification cition of systems and the addition of mult training resources on Infor to assist use prking with the City Auditor's Office on o | did not transfer to card charges of a \$1,000 total ould have been dentify. With Infor, a all transactions ction and a PO e is bifurcation of eks. For example, a ut the PO. That roles in the system. of duplicate iple levels of ers with acclimating | |

Finding 1 - Some Employees Receiving Both a Cell Phone Allowance and City-Issued Cell Phone

| Issue No: | 504 | | | | |
|------------------------------|---|--|---|--|--|
| Date of Finding: | 09/19/2023 | | | | |
| Final Date of Completion | 06/30/2024 | Name | Title | Department | |
| Responsible Person 1 | Ishort | Linda Short | Director | Finance | |
| Responsible Person 2 | | | | | |
| Correction Plan Status: | Implemented | | Finding Type: Finding | 1 | |
| Next Milestone | Work with City Aud | itor's Office to close o | ut finding. | | |
| Milestone Date of Completion | 06/30/2024 | | | | |
| Department: | Finance | | | | |
| Audit Initiator | Commission Audit | | | | |
| <u>Title:</u> | Finding 1 - Some E | Employees Receiving | Both a Cell Phone Allowance and City | -Issued Cell Phone | |
| Issue / Observation | audit period, fisca CAO found 38 (| Substantive testing by data analysis of 100% of cell phone allowances and cell phones during the audit period, fiscal years 2020 through 2022, of 1,009 employees that had a cell phone allowance, CAO found 38 (3.8%) exceptions totaling approximately \$19,000 of cell phone allowances being paid to an employee while also having a cell phone. | | | |
| Recommendation: | | - | Manager have ITS work in conjunc nuing cases of overlapping cell ph | - | |
| Correction Plan: | Management concurs with this finding and has taken steps to implement further controls in the process of issuing City Cell Phones Citywide. This is further delineated in Observation 1 response. Additionally, as recommended, ITS and Finance will conduct a comparative analysis of the cell phone stipend roster against the cell phone issued list to identify any current or past offensives. | | | | |
| <u>Current Status:</u> | does not possess a paycheck. Informa city cell phone to e greater onus is on the from, they verif Finance Departme | a City issued cell phor tion Technology Servic nsure no stipend exist the requesting depart y there is no duplicatio | owance form to add ITS signature conf the prior to the stipend being processed ces (ITS) already has this control in pla is. This additional step will close the ex- ment's Supervisor to ensure before sign on of either the stipend or issued City of arterly financial reports to ITS to comp none allowance. | l in the employees' ace when issuing a kisting loophole. A gning and approving cell phone. The | |

Finding 3 - Physical Inventory for City Vehicles

| Issue No: | 506 | | | | | |
|------------------------------|---|--|-----------------------------------|------------------------|---|--|
| Date of Finding: | 09/19/2023 | | | | | |
| Final Date of Completion | 09/30/2024 | Nama | | T:4 - | L Desertment | |
| Responsible Person 1 | lshort | Name Linda Short | _ | Title Director | Epertment Finance | |
| Responsible Person 2 | | | | | | |
| Correction Plan Status: | Not Implemented | | I <u>Finding Type:</u> | Finding | I | |
| Next Milestone | Create a standardiz | ed process/format to | effectively demo | onstrate annual accour | ntability of the City's fleet equ | |
| Milestone Date of Completion | 06/30/2024 | | | | | |
| Department: | Finance | | | | | |
| Audit Initiator | Commission Audit | | | | | |
| <u>Title:</u> | Finding 3 - Physica | Finding 3 - Physical Inventory for City Vehicles | | | | |
| Issue / Observation | An independent physical inventory of city vehicles has not been conducted for nearly 10 years (November 2013, Finance - Fixed Assets). | | | | | |
| | Auditor Note: An inventory was planned for February 2022, but it was not performed. • This is not in compliance with State regulations, Florida Administrative Code (FAC), Rule 69I-73.006. FAC and City PSM 9.16.1, which require an annual inventory of assets. | | | | | |
| | It was also noted that Fleet's inventory file, a spreadsheet, is not properly controlled by password protection. In 2021, at an annual cost of \$41,000, Fleet began licensing a vehicle inventory management system, but Fleet was unable to provide the CAO with an inventory report produced by the management system. In addition, a full implementation of this system with proper IT general controls would help to ensure inventory records are complete and accurate. | | | | | |
| | • • • | nysical count aspe S-tracking system wi | | entory process, for | several years Fleet has | |
| Recommendation: | Fleet and Final safeguarded and f regulations, | ance are collabora | ting annually o s complete and | accurate, in accorda | ory to ensure assets are ance with PSM's and State | |

- Fleet's inventory software is properly controlled and implemented,
- $\ensuremath{\cdot}$ Fixed Assets recordkeeping is implemented in the ERP system.

Correction Plan:

Management agrees with the overall premise and objectives of the CAO findings/recommendations. However, given the advances in technology used by the City's Fleet Management Team, the need for a complete physical vehicle inventory count has been substantially mitigated by Fleet's automated Global Positioning System (GPS) tracking software. When balancing resource availability, cost, previous and ongoing operational reviews, and site visits, against the additional value-added information to be gained from performing a complete physical inventory count of the City's entire fleet, it is not management's opinion that it is in the City's best interest at this time, and therefore, not recommended for vehicles with GPS tracking.

Based on the ongoing continuous operational efforts (site visits etc.) and technology advances (Collective Data), management believes Fleet is effectively performing a continuous/perpetual audit of the City's fleet inventory and will have Finance work with Fleet to codify its efforts into a standardized process/format to effectively demonstrate its annual accountability of the City's fleet equipment. Furthermore, for the non-GPS vehicles, management does feel it is appropriate to develop a more heightened/targeted review of these vehicles.

<u>Current Status:</u> The Finance Department will collaborate with Fleet Services to conduct a physical inventory audit of the non-GPS vehicles beginning in the Spring of 2024.

City Manager's Office



Finding 1 - Documentation for Lease Obligations

| U | | | <u> </u> | |
|------------------------------|--|--|--|---|
| Issue No: | 476 | | | |
| Date of Finding: | 09/06/2022 | | | |
| Final Date of Completion | 03/31/2024 | Name | Title | Department |
| Responsible Person 1 | rjames | Rufus James | Director | City Manager |
| Responsible Person 2 | charrison | Carlton Harrison | Assistant Director | City Manager |
| Correction Plan Status: | Implemented | - F | Finding Type: Finding | 1 |
| Next Milestone | Follow up with the | City Auditor's Office for C | Case Closure. | |
| Milestone Date of Completion | 03/31/2024 | | | |
| Department: | City Manager | | | |
| Audit Initiator | Commission Audit | | | |
| <u>Title:</u> | Finding 1 - Docum | entation for Lease Obliga | ations | |
| Issue / Observation | FXE Management were being met. | t did not provide suffic | ient documentation to support th | at certain lease obligations |
| | No construction Construct and end dates as as related to lease | documentation was prov ion progress payments s related to the leases' s' minimum cost requirer ation of construction pro- contracts requiring boile bonds; and contractors' insurance ce bond support for one less | gress was completed by visual ir rplate provisions per lease; rtificates. | ng to, wing the construction start alue of the work completed nspection, which is also not |
| Recommendation: | The CAO recommends that the City Manager: - Ensure that FXE management is aware of all lessee obligations, maintains required lease documentation, and implements policies and procedures for monitoring agreement obligations; - Periodically review the lease documentation maintained by FXE Management to ensure compliance with requirements and proper monitoring. | | | |
| Correction Plan: | agreement obligation | | through a new software, Pro E will review all lease policies pdates. | |
| Current Status: | to require monthly | reporting by the prime te | nagement system and updated the A nant for capital improvements for im ed and the Airport will coordinate to | proved controls. |

Finding 2 - Adequate Policies and Procedures for Lease Operations

| | 477 | | | | |
|------------------------------|---|--|---|---|--|
| Date of Finding: | 09/06/2022 | | | | |
| | 03/31/2024 | | | | |
| Final Date of Completion | 03/31/2024 | Name | Title | Department | |
| Responsible Person 1 | rjames | Rufus James | Director | City Manager | |
| Responsible Person 2 | charrison | Carlton Harrison | Assistant Director | City Manager | |
| Correction Plan Status: | Partially Implement | ted | <u>Finding Type:</u> Finding | | |
| Next Milestone | Present draft Airpo | rt Leasing Policy to the | Aviation Advisory Board | | |
| Milestone Date of Completion | 03/31/2024 | | | | |
| Department: | City Manager | | | | |
| Audit Initiator | Commission Audit | | | | |
| <u>Title:</u> | Finding 2 - Adequa | te Policies and Procedu | ures for Lease Operations | | |
| Issue / Observation | FXE Management | lacked adequate policie | es and procedures for lease operatior | IS. | |
| | Policies and procedures provided by FXE Management were incomplete, newly created or update after the audit period, and missing basic internal controls. | | | | |
| | Additionally, the non-existence of an FXE leasing policy breaches Policy and Standards (PSM) 7.3.1, which required the creation of a such a policy as of late 2017, just prior to t period. | | | | |
| | Director of Finan outside contractor and was significa leases. This was c | E-008 Accounts Rec ice in regard to tran to in-house. This tra ant, impacting approx leemed non-compliance | eivable had not been updated asitioning performance of the rem ansition began after the audit perio imately \$700,000 receipts per m with PSM 9.10.1. In July 2021 to manage the new | t collections process from od, on September 1, 2021, onth on approximately 40 | |
| Recommendation: | The CAO recommends that the City Manager: Perform an adequate risk assessment to highlight areas of risk and concern with appropriate control design built to govern leases. When possible, software systems should be used with proper security configurations to enhance the controls environment, preferably administered by Information Technology Services (ITS). Develop and implement comprehensive policies and procedures for lease operations, flowing from the risk assessment. At a minimum, the policies and procedures should be reviewed to determine identified through this finding; however, all policies and procedures should be reviewed to determine if there are other policies and procedures that may need to be developed or updated. | | | | |
| Correction Plan: | procedures. To i with legal counse | initiate the process, F I on relevant procedu | and the Finance Department XE will review all lease policies a ral updates within 120 days. Add e monitoring of lease agreement oblig | and provisions and consult litionally, FXE purchased a | |
| Current Status: | Office and outside has been reviewed | counsel the Airport Lea by stakeholders and th | implemented. In conjunction with the se Form has been revised. The Airpo e comment period is now closed. Th n for staff to present to the Aviation A | ort Leasing Policy e City Attorney's | |

Finding 3 - Lack of Billing Interest Payments and Penalties for Late Rent Payments

| Issue No: | 478 | | | | |
|------------------------------|--|--------------------------------|---|------------------------|--|
| Date of Finding: | 09/06/2022 | | | | |
| Final Date of Completion | 03/31/2024 | Name | Title | Department | |
| Responsible Person 1 | rjames | Rufus James | Director | City Manager | |
| Responsible Person 2 | charrison | Carlton Harrison | Assistant Director | City Manager | |
| Correction Plan Status: | Partially Implemente | ed | i <u>Finding Type:</u> Finding | I | |
| Next Milestone | Update Account Red | ceivable procedures | | | |
| Milestone Date of Completion | 03/31/2024 | | | | |
| Department: | City Manager | | | | |
| Audit Initiator | Commission Audit | | | | |
| <u>Title:</u> | Finding 3 - Lack of E | Billing Interest Payme | ents and Penalties for Late Rent Paym | ents | |
| Issue / Observation | Interest payments a | nd penalties had not | been billed or collected for late rent pa | ayments. | |
| | The City Auditor's Office (CAO) found that were were approximately 500 late payments that total approximately 5,600 late days. The CAO did not observe any interest payments or penalties th were charged for these late days. | | | | |
| | FXE Management | instead of the d there was a 1 | ring them that the lease rent collec outside contractor beginning on s 5-day grace period for late paym | September 1, 2021, FXE | |
| Recommendation: | The CAO recommends that the City Manager: Revise FXE Policy #008 Accounts Receivable to be consistent with leave provisions; Consider implementing a mandatory e-payment program for any new tenants; Collect owed interest and penalties for late payments or have the City Commission waive the amounts owed; and Notify tenants/lessees that there is no grace period for late payments per the agreements and explain the lease provision. Consider implementing a late payment penalty within the City's airport lease template that is effective at incentivizing timely payment. | | | | |
| Correction Plan: | details of pending | • • | ementing an e-payment program. A d interest and penalties and, with nces. | | |
| | Staff will also review | implementing late p | enalties to ensure balances are collect | ed timely. | |
| Current Status: | Financial Administra | tor is updating polici | ed to reflect an e-payment option for re es to reflect the implementation of the ed to be completed within the second o | lease management | |

Finding 4 - Security and Construction Deposits

| U | J | | | | | |
|------------------------------|---|---|---|--|--|--|
| Issue No: | 481 | | | | | |
| Date of Finding: | 09/06/2022 | | | | | |
| Final Date of Completion | 03/31/2024 | Name | I Title | Department | | |
| Responsible Person 1 | rjames | Rufus James | Director | City Manager | | |
| Responsible Person 2 | charrison | Carlton Harrison | Assistant Director | City Manager | | |
| Correction Plan Status: | Partially Implement | ed | Finding Type: Finding | I | | |
| Next Milestone | Finalize financial pr | Finalize financial procedures, submit journal entries updates and upload supporting documentation. | | | | |
| Milestone Date of Completion | 03/31/2024 | | | | | |
| Department: | City Manager | | | | | |
| Audit Initiator | Commission Audit | | | | | |
| <u>Title:</u> | Finding 4 - Security | and Construction Dep | posits | | | |
| Issue / Observation | In some instances lease requirement. | s, security and cons | truction deposits had not been co | ellected in accordance with | | |
| | the sampled lessee - One of 18 lessee - Five of six secur - One of thes no coverage for tha - One lesse requirement. | s were collected; howe es did not pay its secu ity/construction depos se lessees provided of t period. e did not increase id not forfeit its cons | ity deposits and construction depo ever, the CAO noted the following exc rity deposit valued at approximately \$ its collected during the audit period w coverage in bond form which omitte its security deposit upon declar truction deposit of \$36,000 for failu | eptions: 125,000. ere not timely; d the first year, resulting in ring bankruptcy per lease | | |
| Recommendation: | The CAO recommends that the City Manager: Transfer the forfeited funds from the construction deposit in escrow to a City -owned account; Collect the \$125,000 amount due in escrow; Design and Implement policies and procedures to include periodic reconciliation of deposits to the lease provisions and the City's escrow account to ensure that lease provisions have been met; Review all other leases (that were not sampled for this audit) for security and construction deposits to ensure they were properly collected; and Review all security deposits in escrow to ensure that they are correctly in escrow and resolve any discrepancies identified. | | | | | |
| Correction Plan: | The Fort Lauderdale Executive Airport (FXE) will examine all leases and determine if deposits are recorded appropriately in escrow accounts. FXE will also follow up with tenants where deposits are not recorded as escrow in the City's financial records to determine if the amount was received. Staff will work with the Finance Department to ensure that deposits are recorded appropriately. | | | | | |
| Current Status: | Staff will work with the Finance Department to ensure that deposits are recorded appropriately. All leases have been reviewed by the Sr. Financial Administrator. The lease management system has been implemented and the Airport Lease Form has been updated. The Sr. Financial Administrator is updating policies to reflect the implementation of the lease management system and INFOR. Supporting documentation will be uploaded and will coordinate with the City Auditor's Office to close this item. | | | | | |

Finding 7 - File Retention Practices

| U | | | | | |
|------------------------------|---|---|----------------------------------|--|---|
| Issue No: | 485 | | | | |
| Date of Finding: | 09/06/2022 | | | | |
| Final Date of Completion | 03/31/2024 | Name | 1 | Title | Department |
| Responsible Person 1 | rjames | Rufus James | | Director | City Manager |
| Responsible Person 2 | charrison | Carlton Harrison | Assis | stant Director | City Manager |
| Correction Plan Status: | Implemented | | ı Finding Type: | Finding | |
| Next Milestone | Coordinate with the C | ity Auditor's Office to | o close this item | 1. | |
| Milestone Date of Completion | 03/31/2024 | | | | |
| Department: | City Manager | | | | |
| Audit Initiator | Commission Audit | Commission Audit | | | |
| <u>Title:</u> | Finding 7 - File Retention Practices | | | | |
| Issue / Observation | File retention practices should be improved. | | | | |
| | documents, which sl Management had no | hould be readily a ot provided the Cl aserfiche retention | available. Add erk with all c | ditionally, the City Cl urrent airport lease of | uditor with requested lease erk's Office indicated FXE documents that should be ant documents, which has |
| Recommendation: | The CAO recommends the City Manager: - Retrain FXE personnel on proper records retention practices and requirements; and - Develop and implement policies and procedures to adequately maintain files in accordance with records retention requirements and completeness of the lease files. | | | | |
| Correction Plan: | | | | | |
| Current Status: | - | cuments of the traini | ng have been u | ntion procedures by the proced | - |

Observation 3 - Independent Verification Control of Lease Rent Collection

| Issue No: | 488 | | | | | |
|------------------------------|---|--|--|-----------------------------|--|--|
| Date of Finding: | 09/06/2022 | | | | | |
| Final Date of Completion | 03/31/2024 | Name | I Title | Department | | |
| Responsible Person 1 | rjames | Rufus James | Director | City Manager | | |
| Responsible Person 2 | charrison | Carlton Harrison | Assistant Director | City Manager | | |
| Correction Plan Status: | Partially Implemented | | Finding Type: Observation | I | | |
| Next Milestone | Upload supporting do | cumentation on impre | ovements in rent collections. | | | |
| Milestone Date of Completion | 03/31/2024 | | | | | |
| Department: | City Manager | | | | | |
| Audit Initiator | Commission Audit | | | | | |
| <u>Title:</u> | Observation 3 - Indep | endent Verification C | control of Lease Rent Collection | | | |
| Issue / Observation | Collection of lease rer | Collection of lease rents require an independent verification control. | | | | |
| | - | In general, CAO testing determined that rent was accurately billed and collected during the audit period; however, internal controls need improvement. | | | | |
| | During and prior to the audit period, an outside contractor performed the majority of the airport rent collection services. Airport personnel would perform an independent verification of the contractor's performance. The separation of incompatible duties ensured that variations in rent over time, such as additional rental amounts, inflation adjustments, and market rate adjustments, were monitored and billed accurately to lease requirements over the long duration of these leases. This is an important control system because these rent adjustments have a compounding effect over time. | | | | | |
| | However, the audit the outside contractor - Rent accuracy could | , citing the few conce | ne that this control system was erns below. | operating consistently with | | |
| Recommendation: | | monitoring of air | Manager designate a financial ori port leases and independent ve rocess. | | | |
| Correction Plan: | For the period audited, a City contracted third-party was responsible for rent collection which resulted in deficiencies that ultimately led to lease administration responsibilities returning to FXE. FXE staff will research implementation of controls to validate rent adjustments and collections. | | | | | |
| Current Status: | A lease management system has been implemented. The Senior Financial Administrator and Financial Administrator will oversee the lease administration activities. Additional time is needed to upload supporting documentation before coordinating with the City Auditor's Office to close this item. | | | | | |

Finding 2 - Internal Control Process and PSM for City Take-Home Vehicles

| lssue No: | 505 | | | | |
|------------------------------|---|-----------------------|--------------|---|---|
| Date of Finding: | 09/19/2023 | | | | |
| Final Date of Completion | 06/30/2024 | Name | 1 | Title | Department |
| Responsible Person 1 | gchavarria | Greg Chavarria | - | City Manager | City Manager |
| Responsible Person 2 | | | | | |
| Correction Plan Status: | Partially Implemented | | Finding Typ | e: Finding | |
| Next Milestone | Review PSM for updat | es based on this a | udit finding | | |
| Milestone Date of Completion | 03/31/2024 | | | | |
| Department: | City Manager | | | | |
| Audit Initiator | Commission Audit | | | | |
| <u>Title:</u> | Finding 2 - Internal Co | ntrol Process and | PSM for City | Take-Home Vehicles | |
| Issue / Observation | Internal controls pertaining to city take-home vehicles are not complete, cohesive, nor centrally administered. | | | | |
| Recommendation: | The CAO recommends that the City Manager revisit city vehicle usage process and work in conjunction with the respective city departments to update, enhance, and possibly centralize the administration of the PSM. | | | | |
| Correction Plan: | Management agrees at the time of the start of the CAO audit, the internal controls and policies for the City's take-home vehicles needed updating, and in fact, management had proactively engaged in the process of updating several of the PSM related to the internal controls and policies of the take-home vehicles. | | | | |
| | | - | - | recommended updates irther review and processi | have been prepared and ing. |
| | and guidance to em | ployees regarding | the use of | City vehicles. Additiona | Ms that will provide clarity ally, a copy of these audit hison along with the other |
| | | pt or further e | dit the doc | nendations will be made to uments, and then re- | o Strategic publish them for general |
| Current Status: | | ntly in draft version | | - A1 Take Home Vehicle ill be reviewed in the 2 nd | |

Information Technology Services Department



Computer Software and Programs Master Inventory Listing

| Issue No: | 464 | | | | |
|------------------------------|--|---------------------|---------------------|-------------------------|----------------------|
| Date of Finding: | 10/22/2021 | | | | |
| Final Date of Completion | 03/31/2024 | Name | 1 | Title | Department |
| Responsible Person 1 | tmckay | Tamecka McKay | | lirector | Information Services |
| Responsible Person 2 | vflorestal | Valerie Florestal | Business Op | erations Manager | Information Services |
| Correction Plan Status: | Partially Implemented | | Finding Type: | Material Weakness | |
| Next Milestone | Schedule and update | computer Software | and Programs M | aster Inventory Listing |) |
| Milestone Date of Completion | 03/31/2024 | | | | |
| Department: | Information Services | | | | |
| Audit Initiator | Commission Audit | | | | |
| <u>Title:</u> | Computer Software ar | nd Programs Master | r Inventory Listing | g | |
| Issue / Observation | The detailed finding and recommendations have been provided to City Management. Detailed information and status updates will not be provided in this report to protect the security and operation of the City's network. A status update will be provided when the finding has been | | | | |
| Recommendation: | closed. | | | | |
| Correction Plan: | | | | | |
| Current Status: | ITS is conducting the a review date | annual master inver | ntory list and will | update the record crea | ated date and the |

Weak Internal Controls Relating to Software and Programs used by Various Departments

| Issue No: | 465 | | | |
|------------------------------|---|-----------------------|---------------------------------------|----------------------------|
| Date of Finding: | 10/22/2021 | | | |
| Final Date of Completion | 03/31/2024 | Name | I Title I | Department |
| Responsible Person 1 | tmckay | Tamecka McKay | Director | Information Services |
| Responsible Person 2 | vflorestal | Valerie Florestal | Business Operations Manager | Information Services |
| Correction Plan Status: | Partially Implemented | I | i Finding Type: Material Weakness | |
| Next Milestone | Update policies and p | procedure | | |
| Milestone Date of Completion | 03/31/2024 | | | |
| Department: | Information Services | | | |
| Audit Initiator | Commission Audit | | | |
| <u>Title:</u> | Weak Internal Contro | Is Relating to Softwa | re and Programs used by Various Dep | partments |
| Issue / Observation | The detailed finding and recommendations have been provided to City Management. Detailed information and status updates will not be provided in this report to protect the security and operation of the City's network. A status update will be provided when the finding has been closed. | | | |
| Recommendation: | | | | |
| Correction Plan: | | | | |
| Current Status: | The City's PSM 9.3.2 | has been updated a | nd submitted for approval by the Exec | utive Strategy Team (EST). |

Finding 1 - Lack of confirmation that ordered IT service/equipment had been received/working

| I I | | | 5 | | | |
|------------------------------|--|--|---|------------------------------------|--|--|
| Issue No: | 500 | | | | | |
| Date of Finding: | 07/05/2023 | | | | | |
| Final Date of Completion | 06/30/2026 | Name | I Title | Department | | |
| Responsible Person 1 | tmckay | Tamecka McKay | Director | Information Services | | |
| Responsible Person 2 | ccaprio | Cathy Caprio | Sr. Administrative Assistant | Information Services | | |
| Correction Plan Status: | Partially Impleme | nted | Finding Type: Finding | | | |
| Next Milestone | Finalize the Inform | mation Technology Servic | e Management (ITSM) system Imple | ementation | | |
| Milestone Date of Completion | 06/30/2024 | | | | | |
| Department: | Information Servi | ces | | | | |
| Audit Initiator | Commission Audi | it | | | | |
| <u>Title:</u> | Finding 1 - Lack of | of confirmation that ordere | ed IT service/equipment had been re | ceived/working | | |
| Issue / Observation | the IT technicia | n notes "completed" of | onfirmation by the requestor is no r "done" on the TrackIT ticket a d, and/or the date of delivery is not e | nd the ticket is closed. In | | |
| | | is no requirement that rking as intended. | t the requestor confirms that the | IT service/equipment was | | |
| Recommendation: | | | Aanager require that the Director Service/equipment delivery by the re- | - | | |
| | This evidence could be in the form of an e-mail attached to the ticket or a notation of the date/time and the person's name who confirmed delivery noted under the "Resolution" tab of the ticket. It is expected that a new ITSM tool will be implemented in the near future; the department should explore whether the new software has better tracking capabilities than the current system in place. | | | | | |
| Correction Plan: | Modernization p | | b) has recently begun a three chieving IT service excellence by Vorkforce. | | | |
| | (ITSM) system | ITS is currently finalizing the procurement of a new Information Technology Service Management (ITSM) system which will focus on standardizing service and support, operational efficiency as well as IT governance. | | | | |
| | The goal of the ITSM project is not only to replace the existing unsupported and end of life program but to formalize, standardize, and modernize IT service management practices in the City. This initiative will include the adoption of the ITIL (Information Technology Infrastructure Library) framework which is an industry standard based on known and proven principles in efficient, effective, and successful IT management. ITSM modernization will also enable process improvement across the IT organization including asset management, change management, portfolio management, knowledge, contract, and vendor management as well as configuration management, all currently lacking in the IT organization today. | | | | | |
| | | | e scheduled for a 4-day on-sit IT Transformation and Modernizatio | - | | |
| Current Status: | - | I the new Information Tec It is currently in the imple | hnology Service Management (ITSM mentation stage. | /I) system tool, known 30 of 35 | | |

Observation 1 - Outdated PSM 9.3.2 does not reflect current computer environment and practices

| Issue No: | 501 | | | | | |
|------------------------------|--|--|---|----------------------|--|--|
| Date of Finding: | 07/05/2023 | | | | | |
| Final Date of Completion | 03/31/2024 | Name | Title | Department | | |
| Responsible Person 1 | tmckay | Tamecka McKay | Director | Information Services | | |
| Responsible Person 2 | ccaprio | Cathy Caprio | Sr. Administrative Assistant | Information Services | | |
| Correction Plan Status: | Partially Implemented | Partially Implemented <u>Finding Type:</u> Observation | | | | |
| Next Milestone | Finalize and publish re | evisions to PSM 9.3 | 3.2 | | | |
| Milestone Date of Completion | 03/31/2024 | | | | | |
| Department: | Information Services | | | | | |
| Audit Initiator | Commission Audit | | | | | |
| <u>Title:</u> | Observation 1 - Outda | ted PSM 9.3.2 doe | s not reflect current computer enviror | nment and practices | | |
| Issue / Observation | The City's PSM 9.3.2, | dated 07/18/2006, | is outdated and it does not reflect cu | rrent practices. | | |
| | Auditor Note: PSM 9.3.2 describes purchasing/leasing computer hardware and software by various City departments while IT Services' role is restricted to "attending meetings" when vendors solicit departments with new products and "schedule or contract" for training needs. Moreover, the PSM mentions outdated and non-viable technologies in today's environment, such as "ribbons, diskettes" among others. | | | | | |
| Recommendation: | The CAM recommends that the City Manager requires the Director of IT Services to work on updating PSM 9.3.2. Additionally, developing internal policies should be considered that are reflective of the computing environment, the roles and processes of the IT Services department, and its internal controls. | | | | | |
| Correction Plan: | | | by ITS and reviewed by Structunn for review by the 4th quarter of 202 | | | |
| | - | system which w | the procurement of a new Info vill focus on standardizing servic | | | |
| | - | | for a 4-day on-site IT Service Mai on and Modernization three-year pla | | | |
| Current Status: | Revisions to PSM 9.3. | 2 have been subm | itted for approval by the Executive St | rategy Team (EST). | | |

Observation 2 - City departments not reviewing monthly cellphone invoices

| I | | | | | |
|------------------------------|---|--|--|------------------------------------|--|
| Issue No: | 502 | | | | |
| Date of Finding: | 07/05/2023 | | | | |
| Final Date of Completion | 09/29/2023 | Norra | 7:41- | L Desertment | |
| Responsible Person 1 | tmckay | Name Tamecka McKay | Title Director | Department Information Services | |
| Responsible Person 2 | ccaprio | Cathy Caprio | Sr. Administrative Assistant | Information Services | |
| Correction Plan Status: | Partially Impleme | nted | Finding Type: Observation | | |
| Next Milestone | Update PSM 9.3. | 2 to reflect quarterly requi | rement for departments to review c | ellphones issued to employees | |
| Milestone Date of Completion | 03/31/2024 | | | | |
| Department: | Information Servi | ces | | | |
| Audit Initiator | Commission Aud | Commission Audit | | | |
| <u>Title:</u> | Observation 2 - C | Observation 2 - City departments not reviewing monthly cellphone invoices | | | |
| Issue / Observation | | \$12,763.55. Further | approval of a Verizon monthly (C review revealed that monthly | | |
| | balances. If a | Auditor Note: Currently, IT Services performs a cursory review on reoccurring monthly invoice total balances. If a large deviated is notated as compared to prior monthly invoices, IT Services inquires further, otherwise the invoice is paid. | | | |
| | We also noted a | compensating control of a | n annual review of phones by each | department. | |
| Recommendation: | The CAO recommends that the City Manager require the Director of IT Services to take steps to enhance internal controls. Specifically, cellphones assigned to employees are reviewed at least quarterly for accuracy and the review is evidenced by a signature and date. PSM 9.3.2 should reflect these potential updates. | | | | |
| Correction Plan: | | ITS will commend with a quarterly review of city departments to review their cellphones issued to employees for accuracy. The review will require a signature and a date. | | | |
| Current Status: | | phone bills to department n each department is requ | s on a monthly department for revie ired. | ew. Quarterly written | |

Observation 3 - IT equipment/service ordering spreadsheet does not account for age of order tickets

| Issue No: | 503 | | | | |
|------------------------------|---|---|----------------------------|-------------------------|--|
| Date of Finding: | 07/05/2023 | | | | |
| Final Date of Completion | 06/30/2024 | | | | |
| | | Name | Title | Department | |
| Responsible Person 1 | tmckay | Tamecka McKay | Director | Information Services | |
| Responsible Person 2 | ccaprio | Cathy Caprio | Sr. Administrative Assista | nt Information Services | |
| Correction Plan Status: | Partially Impleme | ented <u>F</u> | Finding Type: Observation | | |
| Next Milestone | Finalize impleme | ntation of the Information | Technology Service Managem | nent (ITSM) system | |
| Milestone Date of Completion | 06/30/2024 | | | | |
| Department: | Information Serv | ices | | | |
| Audit Initiator | Commission Aud | Commission Audit | | | |
| <u>Title:</u> | Observation 3 - I | Observation 3 - IT equipment/service ordering spreadsheet does not account for age of order tickets | | | |
| Issue / Observation | The current IT equipment and service ordering spreadsheet, exported from the TrackIT system, does not account for tracking the length of time outstanding for order tickets. Moreover, while dates of orders placed, and their priorities are listed, there are no standards established of how quickly a high, medium, or low priority ticket should be completed. | | | | |
| Recommendation: | The CAO recommends that the City Manager require the Director of IT Services to either expand PSM 9.3.2 or develop a new policy that includes, but is not limited to, establishing completion standards based on ticket priority. In addition, ticket completion should not be tracked against these standards to ensure equipment and services are delivered, installed, and working within the established operating goals. | | | | |
| Correction Plan: | ITS is currently finalizing the procurement of a new ITSM tool which will enable our teams to manage the end-to-end delivery of IT services to customers. This tool will leverage the Information Technology Infrastructure Library (ITIL) standards including Service Levels Agreements. The ITIL framework will allow the organization to establish a baseline from which it can plan, implement, and measure incident response and service requests. Several ITS employees have begun receiving their ITIL certification as part of the IT transformation and modernization three-year plan. | | | | |
| Current Status: | ITS has procured the new Information Technology Service Management (ITSM) system tool, known as Service Now. It is currently in the implementation stage. | | | | |

Observation 1 - ITS Control Process for Issuing City Cell Phones and Removing Cell Phone Allowance

| Issue No: | 507 | | | |
|------------------------------|--|---------------|------------------------|------------------------------|
| | | | | |
| Date of Finding: | 09/19/2023 | | | |
| Final Date of Completion | 06/28/2024 | Name | Title | Department |
| Responsible Person 1 | tmckay | Tamecka McKay | Director | Information Services |
| Responsible Person 2 | ccaprio | Cathy Caprio | Sr. Administrative Ass | sistant Information Services |
| Correction Plan Status: | Partially Implemented <u>Finding Type:</u> Observation | | | |
| Next Milestone | Update policies and procedures | | | |
| Milestone Date of Completion | 03/31/2024 | | | |
| Department: | Information Services | | | |
| Audit Initiator | Commission Audit | | | |
| <u>Title:</u> | Observation 1 - ITS Control Process for Issuing City Cell Phones and Removing Cell Phone Allowance | | | |
| Issue / Observation | ITS control process' for issuing city cell phones and an employee having a cell phone allowance removed needs to be enhanced. There were 18 phones issued in 2022, and 15 employees did not have a cell phone allowance and three employees did have a cell phone allowance. Two employees who had a cell phone allowance did not have the cell phone allowance canceled upon receiving their city cell phone. The new ITS control process, implemented in 2022 and aimed at preventing overlapping cell phone allowance payments and issuance of city cell phones, was not formalized in a written policy and procedure document, The flowchart for the controls were found to be missing key control components, The process, after the cell phone request is verified with Payroll as to existing cell phone allowance, involves a service ticket assignment between ITS employees that does not require documentation and notification of any changes of cell phone end-user, Physical control over cell phones was f | | | |
| Recommendation: | The CAO recommends that the City Manager instruct the Finance and ITS director to enhance its cell phone pre-verification process within a written policy to include, but not limited to: Coordination with the respective departments requesting the cell phone and payroll, Periodic inventory and/or enhanced physical controls over the asset, Enhanced documentation of delivery and receipt of the cell phone Independent review of cell phone end-user, allowances, and inventory by department | | | |
| Correction Plan: | Management agrees the controls around overlapping of cell phone allowances and provided cell phones/mobile devices should be codified in the City's policies and procedure and will update the appropriate policies to ensure clear and concise directions for all staff members. | | | |
| | A greater onus will be placed on the requesting department's Supervisor/Director to ensure before signing and approving they verify there is no duplication of either the stipend / issued City cell phone. ITS and Finance amended the Mobile Device Allowance form to add ITS signature confirming the employee does not possess a City issued cell phone prior to the stipend being processed in the employees' paycheck. ITS already has this control in place when issuing a city cell phone to ensure no stipend exists. This additional step will close the existing loophole. | | | |
| | To enhance and control the mobile devices' physical assets, moving forward ITS will obtain a signature receipt from all staff members issued a mobile device. Also, on the back end, ITS will work with Human Resources (HR) to add ITS to its Employee Separation Checklist to ensure ITS has an opportunity to collect any issued mobile devices prior to any departing staff member's last day of work. | | | |

Workflow process has been implemented and attached for reference along with the cell phone allowance form. The ITS PSM is being updated to reflect new procedure.